Magic Tales that End Badly
E. A. Kostiukhin, Institute of Russian Literature, St. Petersburg

Our conceptions about magic tales have been formed mainly by Vladimir Propp's ideas -- magic tales are works that correspond to his compositional formula. However, both "The Types of the Folktale" by Aarne and Thompson, and the "Comparative Index of Types" in East-Slavic tales contain quite a few types that are listed among magic tales but do not fit Propp's formula. There is an orientation to the magic tale as a narrative, but the scheme has short-comings so that a tale may fall outside a customary category. We are used to the fact that a magic tale always ends happily, but some sad tales exist: the hero or heroine, and sometimes both of them depart this life or do not attain happiness.

Let us take a close look at these tales.1) The happy ending seems obligatory for a magic tale. This can be considered a required test of a magic tale; if it ends badly it is not a magic tale. It is supposed that the happy ending of a tale once had a magic basis, but in time it came to express people's belief in the triumph of justice.2) This is the meaning of a magic tale.

Logically the appearance of a bad ending should deprive the magic tale of its meaning. This, of course, does not happen -- the tale simply acquires a different tone. A sad ending can be accidental and "not programmed": for example, most variants of a tale end happily, but in one variant the hero comes to a bad end. Thus in the tale about two brothers (AT 303) magic twins invariably achieve success. One of them is turned into a stone by a witch (or is torn to pieces), the other overcomes the witch and brings his brother back to life. But in a magic tale from the collection of A. N. Afanasiev (no. 155) the sister of a defeated dragon turns into a lioness and devours one brother, but later she gains mercy from the second brother after disgorging the first. Then the crafty female dragon turns into a baby and goes begging in the open field; next she turns into a lion and tears one brother and then the other to pieces. "Thus perished the all-powerful epic heroes who were destroyed by their dragon sister." Evil triumphs and its power has been validated by the magic tale; it is not easy to overcome evil. Nevertheless, this is an exception from the rule -- the witch is usually defeated.

However, there are some types in which a sad ending is not accidental, but expected. And since such endings do not coincide with the traditional optimistic ending of a magic tale, this compels us to relate such types to other genres of folklore prose such as memorates, legends, and historical narratives. Nevertheless, they are magic tales because they, for the most part, do not pretend to authenticity, and because in their general features they fit Propp's "Morphology of the Folktale," but only if one does not take into consideration its last, or thirty-first, function: "The hero marries and ascends the throne." However, Propp noted such untraditional endings as "unclear elements" and has conceded that they could have come from "other categories of magic tales."3)

Russian folklorists used to regard the influence of memorates on magic tales with
skepticism. Memorates are prose narratives about ordinary life and everyday demonology -- they develop in a completely different way than magic tales. E. V. Pomerantseva(4) was firmly convinced of this and I. A. Razumova in her recent investigation(5) has not shaken the positions of Russian folklorists in this respect. I. A. Razumova, having shown the obvious echoes between the magic tale and the memorate, has also come to the conclusion that the same personages fulfill different functions: they are determined by the generic nature of the magic tale and the memorate. However, some personages, which are typically found in memorates, have been assimilated into magic tales. First of all this concerns the dead.

The vampire is the most terrible of the dead people. In the magic tale about the vampire bridegroom, he devours corpses in a church (or cemetery), then, having assumed the form of her father or mother, he comes to his bride and eats her (AT 363). Russian variants of this magic tale have been published twice (Afanasiev no. 363, Balashov no. 69). In both variants the girl dies, but in Afanasiev's variant, even though the devil kills his bride, she comes back to life and takes revenge on her killer so that everything ends happily -- "as in a magic tale." In Balashov's version "the devil" has lived with his young wife for a while, but then he decides to find out whether she knows that he eats dead people. He comes to his wife in the guise of her father, hears her confess that she knows everything about her husband, "and finally gobbles her up."

The magic tale about the vampire bridegroom is known in Europe and Turkey; in most variants the heroine becomes the victim of the corpse devourer. Only Turkish magic tales about a terrible dervish end, as they should, with the triumph of the heroine who manages to save herself from her terrible husband. In other variants the situation is more complicated. In the Russian tale the bridegroom's "devilish" appearance is not clear. In general, the Russian version of this international type has never fully taken shape. Afanasiev's variant is closer to the Ukrainian and West-Slavic versions. As the Czech folklorist I. Polivka has mentioned, a version has emerged in those Slavic areas where the vampire bridegroom type is joined to the tale about a flower-girl just as occurs in Afanasiev's version. The tale from Balashov's collection is close to Scandinavian and Baltic tales in which the bride is partly guilty herself. She wants her bridegroom to be out of the ordinary -- with a brass beard or with a gold nose. Her wish is granted and the bridegroom appears, but he is the devil. In the Russian tale the bride, a priest's daughter, also chooses the bridegroom with a gold nose and she pays for her choice.

Thus in the South, tales about a dead bridegroom are included among genuine magic tales, while in the North they are close to memorates and fabulates. Here the bridegroom is not dead, but he eats the dead because he is the devil and can assume any form. Contact with evil powers in memorates is always terrifying. The devil is even more terrifying in this tale because the devil is a vampire at the same time. And though some moralistic accents characteristic of a magic tale appear here (the bride is punished because of her exaggerated demands as to her future bridegroom), the main point probably lies elsewhere. The beginning of the tale from Balashov's collection is terrifying. The priest's daughter is sitting alone at the window drinking tea and
outside is someone sitting on a stack of firewood who asks her to drink to his health. Then he starts gnawing the wall. The atmosphere of horror intensifies and as a result a peculiar kind of thriller develops in the magic tale genre.

In general, the desire to terrify is typical of magic tales. The hut of the witch Baba Yaga in Russian tales is surrounded by a paling decorated with skulls, some of which have gleaming eyes. The very image of the dweller of the hut, who is not against treating herself to a visitor and who, as Yaga the cannibal, sticks little children in an oven, is connected with much that is terrifying. But there also are special "thriller tales." Most of them are intended for children since in children's folklore the tradition of "scary" songs and stories is persistent right up to contemporary "scary stories." These scary stories are usually told by children for children. One of them is a scary Russian tale about a cat with silver earrings (VSS 332N*), that in succession lures a girl, a young fellow, an old man, and an old woman into the hands of a cannibal. One such tale from the collection of D. K. Zelenin, a collector from the turn of the twentieth century, ends with a catastrophe. "No one was left at home, the dough-trough has disappeared, and the hut has burned" (Zelenin, Perm Tales, no. 74). The collector states that this tale was "told by children." Another well known variant recorded forty years later in the Yaroslavl region north of Moscow was told by a seven-year old girl.

When he was systematizing the themes and variants of Russian tales, S. M. Smirnov recognized "The cat with gold earrings" as a tale strange to the highest degree. It indeed is strange if we examine it in the context of the traditional magic tale. But it is completely ordinary among other "scary texts," for example, the tale about a wolf that with his song lures the inhabitants of a house outside and then devours them (VSS 163). S. M. Smirnov justifiably has pointed out the similarity of tales about a cat or wolf who sing alluring songs. One of these is a tale about a little goat that pesters everyone it meets in the forest with a question-song: "You animal, you big wild animal, tell me your name. Aren't you my death, won't you eat me?" This lasts until the wolf satisfies the goat's curiosity and eats it (VSS-2015**). And the tale about the bear with a wooden leg belongs to the same kind of tale. These animals sing songs that are terrifying and also alluring. There are not many thriller tales but they exist and are scattered throughout the Aarne-Thompson index. "The Bear with a Wooden Leg" is classified as an animal tale, "The Cat with Gold Earrings" has fallen into the category of magic tales, and "The Goat and Encountered Animals" found a place near cumulative tales. Nevertheless, in all these types cited there is a fundamental magic tale presentation of two worlds. The cat and the bear come from the other world; a goat wanders into a magic tale forest and pays for it with its life. The other world becomes self-sufficient in scary stories, a terrible creature comes from there, and a hero has nothing special to accomplish there. There are variants of these tales where the cat and the bear act together. The bear eats girls who have become his wives because they looked into a forbidden room. It is the cat that brings the girls to the bear's house in this type known throughout the world (AT 311)
Thus on the one hand, the magic tale about a bridegroom corpse-eater borders on the tradition of the memorates and fabulates; on the other hand, this tale borders on the thriller tales that are more characteristic of children's folklore. However, such tales are not alien even to the folklore of grownups. Thus the dead bridegroom tale for grownups has been celebrated in ballads from G. D. Buerger's "Leonore" to P. A. Katenin's "Olga" (AT 365). Thompson describes this type as follows: "The dead bridegroom carries off his bride (Leonore). He carries her behind him on his horse. He says, 'The moon shines bright, the dead ride fast,' and so forth. She is pulled into the grave." In the beginning of the nineteenth century The Russian poets V. A. Zhukovskii and Katenin wrote literary ballads on the Leonore theme. These ballads would scarcely have penetrated into the folk milieu -- Russian tales of this type are free from literary influences. The verse fragments in the Russian variants of this widely known type do not belong to poets, but to the folk tradition. Once again, these are scary tales with questions about whether the supposed victim is afraid or not. Father Frost wants to know whether his beautiful bride is warm or cold. The dead bridegroom carrying his bride to the cemetery sings, "The moon shines, the wind howls, my girl, my girl, are you afraid of me?" (Karnaukhova no, 29). As Thompson has pointed out, the same question occurs in German tales, "Der Mond scheint hell, der Tote reitet schnell! Fuerchtest du dich?" With a similar question the groom turns to his deathly terrified bride in a tale from the collection of N. Onchukov: "The moon is shining outside, who would think where the fellow is riding, where he is carrying the girl, are you afraid of me?" In Karnaukhova's variant the dead person gnaws the doors, but the girl is saved by the crowing of a cock. Although she has endured terror just as the listeners have also probably experienced it, everything ends well. But even worse things happen. The girl may be found dead on the grave of her bridegroom (Onchukov no. 39). One can say that fabulates about the dead have become favorable soil for the emergence of this type which is known to almost all European peoples. Folk ballads about dead people have been composed on this basis, but in different genres the same type may have a different meaning. What happens to the girl in a ballad is the result of the irrational coincidence of circumstances and of the elemental play of life. In the tale everything that happens is much simpler and results from the violation of certain "rules." The girl falls in love with a young man and meets him despite her relatives' wishes. The bride cries too much about her dead bridegroom even though this is forbidden. Therefore, if she were not smart enough to escape, she would become a victim of the deceased. The heroine in a ballad is an uncomplaining victim of circumstances, but in the tale she is a smart girl who knows how to trick the groom who turns out to be a terrifying opponent.

The scary tales, as is apparent, can also end well. On the other hand, these tales inevitably end sadly when the heroine falls victim to her relatives' envy, usually that of her sisters. There are few such tales but they especially stand out. For example, Thompson thus describes "The Magic Flute" (AT 780): "The brother kills his brother (sister) and buries him (her) in the earth. From the bones a shepherd makes a flute which brings the secret to light."
Slavic tales it is always a sister who is killed by her sisters.) "The Snow Maiden" (AT 703) is summarized as follows: "An aged childless couple rears a crayfish instead of a child, carves themselves a child from wood, makes one from snow, and the like." The "Grass Snake's Bride\" receives these remarks: "Bathing girl's garments are kept until promise of marriage. Husband usually serpent or water-being. After reunion, visit home after performing tasks set by husband. Formula for calling on him learned by others who kill him." The tragic finale gives these tales a distinctly ballad-like tone because in ballads girls or young women easily become victims even though the motivations for this are not obligatory. Properly speaking, these are not magic tales although the magical is present in them. These are prose ballads or novellas in which a fatal event stands in the middle of the narrative. Thus in the "Grass Snake's Bride," a popular East-European tale that is most widespread in the Baltic, there are a supernatural husband and envious sisters. These are all motifs that are familiar in tales about a supernatural spouse. They occur in "The Scarlet Flower" and in "Finist the Bright Falcon." But in these tales the lovers are reunited whereas the husband-serpent is killed. From grief his wife is transformed into a cuckoo and her children into swans -- other transformations are possible. Such metamorphosis in the spirit of Ovid is not characteristic of magic tales. This is rather a ballad motif derived from myths about supernatural transformation that were reevaluated and aesthetically reinterpreted long ago. It is to be expected that this type would assume a sung form among the South Slavs. This strange metamorphosis required motivations and they appear, again in the style of memorates. The young man, it turns out, has been touched by the "evil eye": in the daytime he lives in the river and in the evening he takes on a human shape (Karnaukhova no. 59). In passing, it should be pointed out that this tale from Karnaukhova's collection was told by a little girl and that here again one senses the breath of children's "scary folklore" with its horrors and amazement before the wonders of our world.

The tale about the magic flute offers a different version of the transformation. A multitude of variants are scattered over the whole world so that this original tale has often become the subject of special study. Frequently it ends happily: the murdered sister is returned to life and marries. The reason for the murder is the rivalry of the sisters; one of them expects to be married but the other does not. However, a happy ending is not at all obligatory and more often the very mechanism of the murder's revelation attracts the tellers. The flute, which is made out of reed, sings about what has happened -- this little song is repeated numerous times. Three sisters set out to pick berries, the older sisters kill the younger one, and they bury her. The type is compressed so that a typical balladic situation emerges in the foreground with a monstrous crime and miraculous transformation of the murdered girl's soul into a simple song sung by the flute. And, as this has already happened with similar magic tale types, it acquires the form of a ballad which has been sung in England, Scotland, the Scandinavian countries, America, and Canada. Investigators have not come to a single conclusion about the homeland of this type.
L. MacKensen has supposed that it was Belgium and P. Bruester has indicated Poland, but this is not essential here. It is important to state that the magic tale does not simply interact with ballads, but conveys a "ballad-like philosophy."

The question whether "The Magic Flute" belongs to classical magic tales has provoked legitimate doubts. In the Aarne-Thompson index this type has not been placed among magic tales, but among legendary tales, that is, tales with a religious content. In the index of East Slavic tales L. G. Barag has suggested that this was done without sufficient justification. (7) The story with the magic flute can be, of course, one of the links of a magic tale narrative leading to the concluding marriage of the resurrected girl with the tsar or with another noble bridegroom. But the balladic accent brings this tale closer to the category of legends; truth in a miraculous way comes to light. Higher justice triumphs and evil is exposed. We will say more about the "ideas of legends" later but for the time being will remark that in the "Magic Flute" there is no distinct emphasis on religion. The idea of divine retribution is only potentially present.

Among the East Slavs the tale about the magic flute is often combined with the tale about the Snow Maiden (VSS 703*); in both types the girl perishes after setting out with her friends (or sisters) for the forest. But the theme of envy and unconcealed villainy in the tale about the Snow Maiden is usually dampened; the girls have not planned to kill their friend who is made out of snow. There is a different meaning here. The Snow Maiden is pretty, but she has been made artificially and there is no place under the sun for this artificial creation. It could be said that in this type it is clearly shown how fruitless it is to try to rise above the laws of nature if these laws were not violated at every step in magic tales. On the contrary, here we have an unusual case in the denouement of a magic tale with a sad ending. But, as in the "Magic Flute," the ending varies; the Snow Maiden does not perish but simply loses her way. Perhaps only the mythologists have failed to see anything sad in this tale. The Snow Maiden is a beautiful ephemeral maid who has returned to her native heavenly element. (8)

The dramatic outcome in "untypical" magic tales is so unusual against the customary background of "happy endings" that it prompts one to interpret what happens. Why does the girl become (or almost becomes) the victim of a dead bridegroom? Why does the Snow Maiden perish? Classic magic tales do not arouse questions because everything in them takes place "as it should" according to a once and for all established scenario. "Untypical" tales have to do with events far out of the ordinary, thus opening the way for moralizing and philosophizing. Thus magic tales with a dramatic ending can become close to legends. The dead person, who appears to the bride, hides his fatal threat. But the dead person can be invited to the wedding and can "thank" the friend who invites him, in turn asking him to come for a visit. The festive occasion is dragged out; in the other world time passes differently so that the person having returned home finds none of his relatives and friends alive -- many, many years have passed (AT 470).

Contact with a dead person, so typical for memorates, is treated differently in magic tales. Either he terrifies (as in a memorate) or he amazes. The type about a person who has set
out for a visit to the other world is little known among Russian tales, the only variant appearing in Afanasev's collection (no. 358). However, the type is known everywhere in the world, even in China and Japan. Along the way the living person becomes a witness of many strange events and acts which his dead friend interprets for him -- a wide spread legendary motif. The living person returns after several centuries have passed. The tale from Afanasev's collection is simpler; its hero does not travel but simply descends into a grave where he and his dead friend drink three glasses of sweet wine. With each glass one hundred years pass. L. G. Barag, the specialist for Russian tales, has noted the connection of this tale with memorates and also with legends. It is true that Afanasev's tale bears little resemblance to a legend, but it is close to a fabulate. Nevertheless in it exists one of the main ideas of the legend genre -- the relative approximation of everyday ideas about reality. Any gesture and act coming in contact with the miraculous receives a different meaning and the customary structure of the world changes sharply. In the world of the legend smoldering pieces of wood become green trees, sausage is changed into a snake and coals into gold, and apparent piety turns out to be hidden sin. The same thing takes place with time, which flows differently. Properly speaking, it passes only for the living while the dead remain in eternity. The tale from Afanasev's collection is precisely about this: outwardly it is a memorate but by its meaning it is a legend.

An obvious legendary meaning appears in the "Tale about the Fisherman and the Fish" by the Russian poet A. S. Pushkin (AT 555). Pushkin followed version of the brothers Grimm rather than of the Russian folk tale.(9) The typical personage of the magic tale, the donor, here appears before old people for whom it would be better to think about the hour of death, and not about material and social happiness. Therefore the function of the donor is shifted; he does not so much donate gifts as he tests the old man and old woman. They do not withstand these tests and punishment ensues. When the old man and woman wish to become gods, they are transformed into bears or, in some variants, into dogs (Afanasev no. 76, Khudiakov no. 99). It is significant that various animals (a fish, cat, or fox) may appear as donors and test givers in Russian tales; a saint may appear as a miraculous tree in which a holy spirit resides. Punishment comes from above by the will of God, so that we depart from the world of the magic tale for the world of the legend.

In the tale about the old man and woman, their excessive desires are not only condemned, but are also ridiculed. The source of the comic situation lies in the disparity between the real position of the old people and the magnitude of their wishes. The ending of the tale is highly ironic, once again revealing the disparity between what is being desired and what is real. Such irony often appears in tales with nonstandard denouements.

One of these types again returns us to the unclean power, that is, to dead people and ghosts. This is a tale about a youth who wants to learn what fear is (AT 326), a type that is wide spread in Europe with a few exceptions. It includes a multitude of pranks and tricks that are met in animal tales and in anecdotal tales. For instance, rams frighten wolves by showing them a dead
wolf's head and a youth acts in the same way with robbers. Properly speaking, this is a picaresque novella which has accidentally fallen in the category of magic tales. The dead people do not resemble the unclean power of the fabulates, but the hero easily escapes from them because he fools and deceives the robbers as well as the ghosts that are taking part in this clown-like circle dance. And there where terror disappears, laughter appears. The irony is directed not only at the lowered miraculous adversaries, but also at the hero himself. This is all child's play for the youth, but he nevertheless experiences terror when they slip a live fish under his shirt while he is sleeping (Afanasev no. 348).

Irony also appears in one highly strange type about deception (VVS 664 A*, 664 B*). Unlike the majority of tales under discussion, the tale about deception is purely Russian. The soldier (hauler) deceives an innkeeper from whom he has begged permission to spend the night, or he deceives the tsar himself, compelling him to experience many adventures. The innkeeper is not only deceived, but he also flies off his sleeping bench, having beaten himself on both sides. The humor of this tale is gloomy because the innkeeper has suffered. N. P. Andreev placed this tale in the category of types about miraculous talent. Actually the hero of the tale possesses such a talent but it brings him no benefits. "The innkeeper drove him out of the house. Ivan the Hauler roamed and roamed, and left for another kingdom" (Afanasev, no. 377). The laws of the classical magic tale narrative once again have been violated and once again this has not come off without the influence of memorates. It is no accident that Afanasev, commenting on this tale, recalls sorcerers. "To deceive or to pull the wool over someone's eyes means to compel everyone present to see what actually does not exist. This wizardly art is attributed to sorcerers and to witches."(11) Here we are dealing not so much with the power of magic as with the power of the unclean. But this power does not bring serious evil (if we do not consider that the innkeeper has been left with coals instead of gold), and hence the humorous tone of the narrative, although this is rather black humor.

A survey of non-standard tales, which, for the most part, are located in the section on magic tales in the Aarne Thompson index, shows that they all border on other types of folklore prose, but not only prose. In general, the simplest solution is to exclude them from magic tales on the basis that they do not fit the "standard." However, as becomes clear, the majority of them have maintained firm points in common with Propp's "Morphology of the Folktale." A second solution is to acknowledge the instability of inter-generic boundaries and to declare such tales as marginal. These could be magic tales that have resulted from the expansion of memorates. Hence their real, although to be sure half real, character. Other solutions do not need to be sought, but one has to acknowledge that the artistic potential of magic tales is broader than the customarily stated phrase "as in a magic tale." Not everything here ends well but sometimes also turns out badly.

The charm of a happy denouement, nevertheless, is very great. Therefore tales with a dramatic ending are often met in two versions -- happy and unhappy. The Snow Maiden melts,
the magic flute sings about the death of the girl, and the dead person drags his promised after him into the grave -- these are tragic endings. But the Snow Maiden can be saved, the murdered girl can be revived and can be happily given in marriage, and the bride can outwit her deceased bridegroom and be saved. In these tales the action returns to the traditional magic tale ending. This charm, however, does not affect tales containing the ideas of legends because here retribution is inevitable and the truth revealed does not lend itself to an ambiguous interpretation.

Most often it turns out that the themes of memorates are utilized in tales with a dramatic ending: it is a question of contacts with deceased people, sorcerers, or the "unclean" in general. But their functions in tales are different than in memorates. Not a manifestation and assertion of some belief, but amazement before the unpredictability of chance is what lies at the basis of a tale which apparently resembles a memorate. But tales about fate and about the play of chance already belong to the sphere of the folklore novella into which the nontraditional magic tale enters. On the other hand, a "balladic tone" is clear in such tales -- that is why some magic tale types so easily pass into ballads. And if they do not make the transition, then the most tense situations appear in tales with song texts. Song "inserts" not only emphasize individual situations, but they repeatedly compel us to experience a feeling of terror when the hero falls into a possibly fatal situation. This again leads us beyond the bounds of magic tales into children's folklore with its aesthetic of the terrifying.

Tales that end badly present evidence of the fact that tales have a greater possibility than initially apparent. They can frighten and they can turn to a dramatic play of life's circumstances. They can compel one to think about how wonderfully the world has been created and how relative human ideas about time and fate are. They can also provoke a smile at the limitation of these ideas when accidental elevation is instantly replaced by a fall, and conviction in the stability of the world collapses into dust. In a word, such tales significantly expand the artistic dimension of magic tales and save them from dull schematism or oversimplification.

Abbreviations

Karnaukhova -- Skazki i predania Severnogo kraya [Tales and legends of the Northern region]. Ed. I. V. Karnaukhova. Leningrad, 1934.
Khudiakov - Velikorusskie skazki v zapisakh I. A. Khudiakova [Great-Russian tales in the
Notes

4. "Mythological images in Russian oral prose, going back to a common source -- folk belief, at the same time are deeply different both qualitatively and functionally not only in tale and non-tale prose, and not only in different prose genres, but even in different kinds of tales -- in magic, legendary, and everyday tales. This is explained by the fact that they are included into different systems of images and into the most varied structures." E. V. Pomerantseva. "Mifologicheskie personazhi v russkom fol'klore" [Mythological personages in Russian folklore]. Moscow, 1970. p. 150.
10. In the notes to item no. 375 in the Academy of Sciences edition of the tales of A. N. Afanasev it is mistakenly indicated that S. Thompson considers the European versions of this type whereas Thompson actually refers only to Russian variants.

(Translated by James Bailey)