Language and Otherness: Popular Fiction and the Amish

"It's just so awful dangerous . . . out in the modern, fancy world."
Mandy in *The Missing*

One does not have to read very far in author Beverly Lewis's *The Missing* to know that Mandy and her sister Grace are different. Dressed in long work aprons, they are plain, not like the "fancy folk," and they live in a solid pioneer house with hand-built dressers, wooden floors and blanket chests. Most strikingly, they talk funny, their English old fashioned and mixed with German. Dad is "Dat," grandmother is "Mammi," and grandfather is "Dawdi," the strange words italicized lest we fail to remark their foreignness. From the beginning, a "Pennsylvania Dutch" constructed from German words and outdated English syntax marks these girls as Amish and presents them as a study in contrast to the modern reader.

Speaking German and Being Amish

The social role Pennsylvania German, commonly called Pennsylvania Dutch, plays in constructing and maintaining Old Order Amish and Mennonite identity has long been recognized. An unwritten, unstandardized language, Pennsylvania German acts to keep these groups separate from the dominant culture; at the same time, the commitment of these groups to remaining separate keeps Pennsylvania German alive.

For the Amish themselves, Pennsylvania German stands as a Zaun, a fence that protects the church from the forces of modernity. The late sociologist John A. Hostetler once asked Joe Byler, then editor of the Amish publication *The Diary,* whether the Amish would ever pray in English. Byler answered that, "Once the Amish pray in English, they are no longer Amish." Much earlier, nineteenth-century Missouri Preacher John Kauffman warned his church not to use English, the world's language, "because the world will get us and then the devil." For the Amish, Pennsylvania German, like wearing...
archaic-looking dress, rejecting technology, and insisting on an agrarian way of life, helps to reinforce group boundaries, perpetuate group values, and realize religious beliefs.

But while the Amish use German to help keep their communities separate from the outside world, popular non-Amish authors use it to invite that world into the lives of Amish families and give it access to the most private of Amish thoughts, hopes, fears, and desires. Speaking “in the know,” with an authority reinforced by their command of a language inaccessible to their readers, writers as diverse as award-winning author Jodi Picoult, romance novelist Beverly Lewis, and science fiction writer Allen Kim Lang have given voice to Amish characters. These and other popular writers draw on Pennsylvania German, German-accented or “Dutchified” English, and the bilingualism of Old Order communities to construct an Amish idiom that defines what it means to be authentically Amish and mediates between the Amish world and our own.

Old-fashioned Language and Strange Ways

Although, in real life, the Old Order Amish constantly confront and negotiate with the modern world, popular fiction often presents the Amish, with their horse-drawn buggies, straw hats, and non-electric lives, as unchanging links to the past. From these texts we know that all Amish quilt and build barns together, ride in buggies and lack electricity. They are old-fashioned, even if we are not always sure what time period they belong to. In Jodi Picoult's *Plain Truth*, lawyer Ellie Hathaway, ordered to stay with an Amish family so that she can watch over her young Amish client, is relieved to discover that the family's home is not the *Little House on the Prairie* she had been expecting. Instead the appliances remind her of those her “grandmother had had in the 1950s.”

Even though the English spoken by most Amish differs little from that spoken by their non-Amish neighbors, the speech of fictional Amish characters is often strangely archaic, evidence in print that these relics of the past are strangers in our modern world. In *The Witch Tree Symbol*, author Carolyn Keene's girl detective, Nancy Drew, finds that folks in Pennsylvania's Amish country have a “quaint” way of speaking, and her friend, George, suggests laughingly that, “We may have some trouble understanding what people say in these parts.” Similarly, in *Angels Watching Over Me*, the first of Lurlene McDaniels' *Angel* trilogy, a series written for young adults, the young non-Amish teenager Leah finds the speech of her Amish friends surprisingly old fashioned. Meeting seventeen-year-old Ethan, for example, Leah responds to his use of “harshly” by thinking, “What a weird word for a teenage guy to use.” By the second volume of McDaniel's trilogy, Leah finds Ethan's speech
musical and, like Nancy Drew and her friends, wonders at the Amish and their "quaint way of phrasing sentences."10

Hardly unique to fiction for young adults, the use of language to link Amish protagonists to bygone days cuts across literary genres. For example, mystery writer Roma Greth characterizes the Amish community in Plain Murder as living "at a slower pace, in another time,"11 and her Amish characters drive this point home by speaking English slowly and as seldom as possible. Christian fiction writer Beverly Lewis's non-Amish characters speak openly about the Amish as a people living in the past. In The Crossroad, the second book in a two-book series, cameraman Rick Henning is surprised when writer Philip Bradley tells him he can't do a photo shoot in an Amish home. "Are you saying I can't zoom in on the eighteenth century, standing halfway across a pasture?" he says.12 Lewis's Amish characters reinforce this notion that they are a people misplaced in time by speaking the "archaic" English of Hollywood westerns in which the progressive form of the verb is often preceded by "a" and generally lacks a final "g": "Rachel's a bit perplexed, I'm a-thinkin'."13

But more than simply old fashioned, the Amish, like our ancestors who came from other lands, are foreign. Picoult's lawyer, Ellie, is surprised to hear her aunt, Leda, who is "as American" as she is, "slip into the Germanic dialect."14 As she discovers later, the language of her aunt's Amish relatives is "unintelligible."15 The strangeness of the fictional Amish idiom highlights the differences between Amish life and our own and names the terms on which the cultures interact. In romance novelist Colleen Coble's Anathema, the ex-Amish woman and the non-Amish police officer who loves her both refer to the non-Amish as "Englisch," the German spelling of the word startling in a conversation apparently conducted in English.16 The Amish are "unser Leut" in P. L. Gaus's novels, and "the People" for Beverly Lewis's fictional Amish characters. Non-Amish are "Englisher" in works by Jodi Picoult and Beverly Lewis, "de Hochens [the high ones]" in those by mystery writer P. L. Gaus, "these English" for T. Myer's Mennonite detective, and "outsiders" in L. McDaniel's Angel trilogy.

The Amish accent emerges in a mix of unvoiced consonants and superlative compounds. The chust wonderful-gut of author Beverly Lewis's protagonists, for example, is echoed by Barbara Workinger's Granny Hanny, who in moments of stress pronounces her "j"s like "ch"s and adopts a "Pennsylvania Dutch accent, liberally sprinkled with 'Dutch' and German words."17 Others, like Nancy Drew's Amish friend, Henner, who enthuses, "Oh, Nancy . . . you kept us from being dead already yet,"18 use verbuddelt or mixed up English. P. L. Gaus uses neither device to introduce young Lydia Shetler in Clouds Without Rain, but he comments that she speaks "with the classic Dutch accent
Diverse Amish characters, like mystery writer Karen Harper's young Amish farmer Eben (Down to the Bone), romance writer Wanda E. Brunstetter's Will (adopted by an Amish family in White Christmas Pie), and Beth Wiseman's Amish widower Sam (in the Amish-themed romance Plain Perfect), begin utterances with "ach," use Ja instead of "yes," and mix German words and phrases in their everyday speech.

Language and Values

Such linguistic devices hint at the social isolation of the Amish protagonists; their interaction with the modern world and twenty-first century American culture is limited, and their fictional idiom marks them as a people out of touch with everyday events and strangers in their own land. For the reader, this can mean comic relief. Freni, the Amish cousin of Magdalena Yoder, mystery writer Tamar Myers's Mennonite detective and B & B owner, interprets one non-Amish guest's request for Thai food to mean she should boil his neckwear. She also loses her English at inopportune times, thinks cheese is a vegetable, and, although she is "church Amish" and so "not as strict as some of her brethren," finds "everything about the outside world . . . an enigma."

But isolated from modern society, the Amish characters may be in touch with values that are in danger of disappearing from modern life. Myer's heroine and unwilling sleuth, Magdalena Yoder, is no longer Amish but remains close to her Amish roots, a cultural position evident in her unwillingness to tolerate swearing; her younger sister, Susannah, a study in contrast who went so far as to marry and divorce a Presbyterian, swears frequently. In Linda Castillo's Sworn to Silence, a novel about a serial killer in Ohio's Amish country, the ex-Amish police chief describes the Amish as "Hardworking. Religious. Family Oriented." She calls herself as an "anomaly"—she is single, a workaholic, estranged from her family, drinks, and may have killed someone. Emma Zook, the Amish cook in Marta Perry's "love inspired suspense" novel Hide in Plain Sight, is hard-working and careful not to say anything that sounds prideful. Asked whether she grieved that her mentally retarded adult son would never have a family of his own, Emma is content in her faith. "No, not grieve. He is as God chose to make him. I accept that as God's will." Emma comments later, "Ja. . . . It is good to know where you belong."

Indeed, one might conclude that the Amish mask beneath their picturesque clothing and quaint speech a wisdom we would do well to heed. Granny Hanny, Barbara Workinger's Amish detective in novels such as In Dutch Again, works with her once Amish granddaughter, a practicing lawyer, to solve murders in her small farming community. Granny Hanny's attempts
to use popular expressions lead to mixed metaphors ("That Ian Hunter is too smart a cookie to try to pull the wool over his head already") that mark her as quirky and innocent. At the same time, she is sage, pragmatic, and "authentically Amish," and her calm, common sense approach to solving crimes offers a stark contrast to the bumbling behavior of the local police detective, who is awestruck by the celebrities he encounters.

Some science fiction writers have drawn on the simple, sage devotion that the Amish seem to show to traditional values to counterbalance the terror and uncertainty of a future in which science dominates all. For example, writer Allen Kim Lang theorizes that cultures go backwards technologically in the process of colonizing new worlds. Amish settlers are, thus, ideal colonizers because they can help other colonists regain technological expertise lost through this regression. In Lang's short story, "Blind Man's Lantern," Amish newlyweds Aaron and Martha Stoltzfoos journey to the planet Murna in search of the farmland that is in short supply on an overpopulated and overdeveloped Earth. It is a homesteading deal; in return for their land, the Stoltzfooses are supposed to help an earlier set of space travelers start the planet "back toward the machine age."

As they leave the spaceship with their horse and buggy, Lang's Amish couple is clearly alien, not only to the strange world of Murna, but to the crew from Earth that ferries them to their new home. They are simple people, and their speech, a mix of German and English, reflects a life in which they are at home with the livestock as well as with those who fly their spaceship. "Sei schtill, Wutzchen," Fraa Stoltzfoos says comfortingly to their pig. "We're reddie far geh, Captain [we're ready to go]," her husband tells the ship's commander. He goes on to recite the list of foreign delicacies they will offer the captain and his crew when the ship returns with other Amish settlers, including "onion soup and Panhaas, Knepp and Ebbelkuche, shoo-fly pie and schärifer cider." The reader may not understand the menu, but it is clear that these traditional dishes signal the taming of this wild frontier.

It seems we can depend on those who do not quite control modern idioms and find respite and fulfillment among them. Romance writer Shelly Shepard Gray's Anna, heroine of Gray's _Hidden_, leaves her abusive fiancé and finds shelter with her New Order Amish friend Katie, who has to remember to use English instead of German and whose "knowledge of the outside world was sketchy at best." Before coming to stay with the Amish, Anna was "fancy" and spoiled, but in Katie's home she becomes hardworking, competent, and plain. Similarly in Beth Wiseman's "fictional love story" _Plain Perfect_, Lillian leaves her abusive home life to find shelter with her Amish grandparents. Mislead by an Amish boy's archaic "down yonder a spell" to think the farmhouse she is seeking is only a short walk away, Lillian gratefully
accepts a ride in a passing buggy, telling the driver that she’ll work hard for her grandparents and will be Amish “if that’s what it takes to feel peaceful and calm.”

Moreover, shelter with the Amish means acquiring the wisdom of the Plain People. By the end of Wiseman’s novel, Lillian has joined the Amish church, married an Amish man, and responds “Ja” instead of “yes.” Gray’s Anna learns to be patient, to avoid gossip, and to trust in God. In Plain Truth, Jodi Picoult’s lawyer Ellie Hathaway, packing to leave Lancaster County, muses about the things that she will take back from her stay among the Amish: “spirit, humility, peace.”

Language and Alienation

Nevertheless, their foreign, archaic tongue clearly marks the Old Order Amish as “the other,” different from us in every way, and the refuge their world seems to offer may be illusory. We cannot turn to those we cannot understand, and the strange language of the Amish makes them—and their world—incomprehensible. Sarah Fisher, the Old Order mother in Picoult’s Plain Truth pleads with her husband “in a language [the police officer] could not understand,” and when a doctor asks eighteen-year-old Katie Fisher if she speaks English, she replies, “Ja.” Some Amish characters, like the Bishop in Gaus’s Blood of the Prodigal, mix German and English together in a code switching that emphasizes the differences between the two cultures. “I intend no disrespect,” the Bishop comments to the local non-Amish school teacher, for example, “but Wir sind Bauern. Verstehen Sie Bauern? Do you understand? We are Bauern, peasants.” Other Amish characters use standard German and “Dutchified” English to mark their alienation from the American mainstream. Amishman Enos Coblentz talks to Dokter Branden in Gaus’s Blood of the Prodigal, while the bishop calls Branden Herrn Professor. In Gaus’s Broken English (the title has double meaning), D. Hawkins, a former Green Beret and convert to the Amish, can only explain himself in German. Acknowledging that he could have killed the murderer of his daughter, Hawkins responds, “Mehr doffä net so du, Herr Professor. Murder is forbidden.” Most tellingly, in the late novelist Tristan Egolf’s Kornwolf, perhaps the most bizarre of recent fictional works about the Amish, the conflict between the Amish world and the dominant English one plays out in a clash of flash-bulb popping tourists and trapped Amish buggy drivers. Young Ephraim, mute and alienated from his own abusive Amish world, morphs into a werewolf and rampages through the Lancaster County countryside. According to on-lookers, the so-called “Blue Ball Devil” “don’t speak English too good.”

As these works make clear, those who find sanctuary in the Amish world pay a steep price. Whereas our society values individuality, the Old Order
Amish of these novels suppress it. In Gaus's *Blood of the Prodigal*, Little Jeremiah Miller feels guilty for getting up early to enjoy the dawn, worried that this "could give him a sense of identity separate from the others." McDaniel's Leah realizes that "the part of Amishness she could never accept" is "the complete smothering of individual reality." In Picoult's *Plain Truth*, Katie's psychiatrist asserts that, unlike the dominant culture, which "promotes individuality... the Amish are deeply entrenched in community... To the Amish, there's no room for deviation from the norm... If you don't fit in, the consequences are psychologically tragic."

Further, failure to fit in, to suppress individual difference, invariably leads to the *Bann*, or excommunication, and *Meidung*, or shunning—those most well-known and least understood features of Amish life. For the Amish, excommunication and shunning are a biblically mandated response to wrongdoing. The Bible says to "root out the evil-doer from your community" (I Corinthians 5:12-13). Following the biblical command that one neither eat nor keep company with those expelled from the church (I Corinthians 5:11; II Thessalonians 3:14), shunning requires members of the community to cease all social and business relationships with the excommunicated person. The Amish see excommunication and shunning as an act of love, believing that excommunication and shunning will protect the community from the wrongdoer and convince the one shunned to repent and return to the community.

With few exceptions, however, these texts present the *Bann* and *Meidung* as one final, unforgiving, and, for the non-Amish audience, inconceivable act, a rejection and ostracism that destroy the life of the one who is shunned. Tellingly, it is marked in these works by silence, the absence of language. Gaus suggests that, for the Amish, someone shunned is "dead to them but still alive," and church members will hardly mention the name of the outcast. "Do not speak to me with your English tongue," Amish farmer Jacob tells his sister, Katie, the local police chief. Lewis's Katie "could remember her Mammi Essie telling about a man who had been shunned for using tractor power. None of the People could so much as speak to him or eat with him, lest they be shunned too. 'It's like a death in the family,' Essie told her." When Katie herself is shunned, none in her community will speak to her.

Clearly, Old Order life may be stable, secure, and grounded in tradition and morality, but, these works make clear, it is also confining, suppressive, and totalitarian, suggesting that the Amish are hardly the innocent God-fearing folks of tradition and certainly not worthy of any special consideration. The Amish mother in Picoult's *Plain Truth* commits infanticide to keep her daughter from leaving her community. In detention with others from his Amish "gang," Egolf’s Ephraim finally speaks, snarling "genug" [enough].
is the beginning of the end for him, and, in not-quite-human form, he leaves his community, fleeing hatred and flames.

These works portray a darker side to Amish life, a world in which traditional values are sacrificed to tradition run amok. The archaic tongue of Amish protagonists hints at a blind devotion to the past that robs the present of creativity. The simple life of the Amish is lived at the expense of free will and individual control. McDaniel's Leah wants to ask the Amish boy Ethan why his family keeps watch over the body of his little sister before the funeral, but "decided he probably didn't know. He rarely knew the why of their customs, only that it was always done that way." Lasky's Meribah finds her life "defined not by herself but by others." The Old Order world is a "closed society" in which each individual has a "sure fate," and Amishness is like a disease one escapes with difficulty. "If it were a tumor," a Mennonite woman comments about her husband, who was raised Old Order, "he could go to a surgeon and have it cut away. But it's imbedded in him. . . ."

Ultimately, these works suggest, leaving the Amish means finding freedom. In Gaus's *Blood of the Prodigal*, Professor Michael Branden, who dresses Amish on occasion, sets up a scholarship fund for young Amish who wish to leave the Amish church. Branden denies that he is encouraging young people to leave their families but asserts that those who wish to do so will have his help. He will give them "a chance." While the pastoral, in these texts identified with the Old Order, has traditionally been seen as sanctuary from the rat-race of modern life, in fact, these novels suggest, our increasingly urbanized, industrialized, and technologically complex society permits greater individual freedom and self-determination. Lewis's Katie, shunned from her Old Order community, delights in her freedom: "No more Ordnung hanging over my head. No more bishop telling me how to dress, how to pin up my bun, how not to sing. . . . I've been cut loose to discover who I truly am."

**Dutch and the Lessons of Amish Life**

Clearly, the non-Amish world is of two minds about the Old Order Amish.

As David Weaver-Zercher has pointed out, today's popular representations of Amish life run the "representational gamut from noble Americans to pathetic bumpkins." The Amish, Weaver-Zercher argues, have been domesticated—"fashioned and refashioned to function towards particular ends." In this Amish-themed literature, German, Dutchified-English, and non-standard spellings help turn the Amish into our pioneer ancestors, reassure us that the Plain People continue to guard traditional values, and provide us an escape from the pressures of our modern lives. At the same time, however, the strange language of the Amish drives home the foreignness of these people.
Language and Otherness: Popular Fiction and the Amish

who live among us. Their strangeness, Weaver-Zercher points out, lets us feel “normal.”

But while Amish-themed literature meets the needs of its readership, it also meets the needs of those who produce it. As journalist Andrea Sachs points out, these works generate over a billion dollars in sales annually; indeed, they constitute “one of the few bright spots for foundering Christian publishers.”

In their use of dialect, authors of Amish-themed fiction writers claim insider knowledge in their depictions of Amish life. Publishers make these claims explicit for the reader. For example, dust jacket quotes praise one author for providing “an insider’s look at Ohio’s Old Order Amish culture” and another for presenting “a fascinating portrait of Amish life rarely witnessed by those outside the faith.” In other words, language not only constructs the Amish protagonists of this literature, but it also constructs the authors as authorities on Amish life. The strange speech of the Amish in these texts serves to validate the authors’ construction of both the Amish characters and the relationship between the Amish characters and the non-Amish counterparts with whom they share the fictional landscape. Dialect makes these authentic portraits of Amish life well worth the purchase price.

Conclusion

As linguist James Paul Gee argues, “we continually and actively build and rebuild our worlds not just through language, but through language used in tandem with actions, interactions, non-linguistic symbol systems, objects, tools, technologies, and distinctive ways of thinking, valuing, and believing.” Amish-themed fiction, made authentic through language that is exotic and foreign, invites us into an otherwise inaccessible world. Through these texts we can be voyeurs, indulging in fantasies of life in a pre-industrial world. After all, as one journalist put it, “Bird-in-Hand is an appealing place for a jaded Englischer to escape to for a while.” We can read these works, safely visit Old Order homes from the comfort of our armchairs, and see what is normally hidden, secure in the knowledge that we have the “real story.”

SUNY Potsdam
Potsdam, New York

Notes

2 The Old Order Amish communities are marked by the use of Amish High German for church services, Pennsylvania German for intra-community oral interaction, and English for written communication and for dealings with those outside the church. For example, see
Festschrift for Earl C. Haag


A. N. Keim, ed. *Compulsory Education and the Amish: The Right Not to be Modern* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1975), 10

This incident was described in a note found in the Muddy Creek Farm Library in a box of materials related to language use in the Plain Churches. The Muddy Creek Farm Library, currently located in Ephrata, Pennsylvania, was founded by Amos B. Hoover and located in his home in Denver, Pennsylvania.

Kauffman was quoted in a letter to *Family Life* from Paul A. Hostetler (January 1983). According to this source, John Kauffman was preaching in Shelby City and Woodford City, Illinois, arguing that “if they get the ‘Welt sproch (English) no gruckt die Welt euch, no gruckt da teifl euch.”


Ibid., 49.


Ibid., 48–49.


P. L. Gaus, *Clouds Without Rain* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1999), 2. Gaus’s Amish characters sometime use standard German rather than their own Pennsylvania German. For example, in the second in the series, *Broken English* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2000), an Amish woman addresses Gaus’s professor-detective, Michael Brandon, as Herr Professor (43). Often Gaus points out that conversations between Amish characters (to which the readers are not privy) are in a “low German dialect” (e.g., *Clouds Without Rain*, 74).


Ibid., 188.

Ibid., 38–39.


This characterization is Perry’s own and is taken from her website. Perry refers to herself as an “inspirational romance author.” http://www.martaperry.com/books.html (accessed 19 August 2009).


Language and Otherness: Popular Fiction and the Amish


30 Ibid., 4–5.

31 The characterization of the novel is from the Wiseman's website. (http://www.bethwiseman.net/About_the_Author.php, accessed 19 August 2009). *Plain Perfect* is the first in a five volume series called *Daughters of the Promise*.


34 Ibid., 22–23


36 Ibid., 55, 157.


43 L. Castillo, *Sworn to Silence*, location 2289.


50 In discussing how Amish young people leave school at the end of eighth grade, Gaus's characters, Professor and Mrs. Branden, are apparently saddened by the lack of opportunity for the brightest Amish students. See 43–46.


53 Ibid., 13.

54 Ibid., 5.

55 Weaver-Zercher points out that the commodification of the Amish "demands two distinct parties: one that sells the Amish (the merchant) and another that buys the Amish (the consumer)."


59 A. Sachs, "Amish Romance Novels: No Bonnet Rippers."