## Gerhard K. Friesen

## Documentary Evidence about the Alleged Love Affair and Temporary Insanity of Jonathan Lenz, Junior Trustee of the Harmony Society

During its century-long existence in the United States (1805-1905), the Harmony Society successively built the towns of Harmony in Pennsylvania, New Harmony in Indiana, and Economy in Pennsylvania. Under strong leaders that ruled as benevolent dictators over faithful followers not interested in individual freedom, three generations of Harmonists made pioneering contributions to agriculture, craftsmanship, manufacturing, commerce, transportation, architecture, the arts, and education in nineteenth-century America. But while their worldly ventures prospered, the biological extinction of these apostolic Christians transplanted from Swabia was only a matter of time after they adopted the rule of strict celibacy in 1807. According to the millenarian creed established by their founding patriarch George Rapp (1757-1847), Adam, having been created in the exact image of God, was originally both masculine and feminine but lost his bisexuality in the fall from paradise. It was the duty of all Harmonists, whether married or not, to abstain from beastlike sexual intercourse that would only serve to propagate the race of fallen man and thus interfere with the advent of God's kingdom. The history of the Harmony Society shows that those who could not adhere to celibacy were relentlessly expelled from it. This article deals with the exceptional case of one prominent Harmonist who fathered two children outside the society but did not suffer expulsion and eventually even assumed a trusteeship that lasted twenty-two years.

After the death of R. L. Baker (1793-1868), Jacob Henrici (1804-92) became the Harmony Society's senior trustee, and Jonathan Lenz (1807-90) was appointed its junior trustee. Dated one day after he died on 23 January 1890 in Economy, an otherwise favorable obituary alleged that he had been involved in a secret love affair which temporarily demented him:

In the early history of the oil regions Mr. Lenz was dispatched thither to attend to the society's investments. There he became fascinated with an heiress. He wooed and proved an acceptable suitor. A date was set for the marriage. The struggle between his obligations to the society and his fascination for the young lady was most severe. Meanwhile the society learned of his attachment and Mr. Henrici was sent to nip the love blossom in the bud. It was only after the most powerful appeal that the erring brother was persuaded to return to Economy. But his infatuation was so deep-rooted that it affected his reason and symptoms of insanity developed. Mr. Lenz was placed in Dixmout [sic] Asylum for several months. The temporary aberration gradually passed away and he returned to the society, his faculties fully restored. His former asceticism had given way to a placid, genial, affable manner.<sup>2</sup>

A similar statement was made in the *Pittsburgh Leader's* extensive analysis of the Harmony Society's situation in 1890:

[. . .] it has been asserted that Mr. Lenz was married to a Lady in Clearfield county, and by whom he had two children. Mr. Lenz as one of the trustees made frequent visits to the oil country to look after the large society there, and it is said that he became so infatuated with a young lady that he married her in secret. For a long time this knowledge was kept a secret even from his most intimate friends. As such things always do the marriage finally leaked out and reached the ears of Mr. Henrici. Quite a sensation was created over the falling from grace of such a prominent member, and for a time Mr. Lenz was in danger of dismissal; his reason became unbalanced and he was incarcerated in Dixmont for a few months. When his mind was restored, the question of his committing a breach of the agreement was attributed to his, at that time, weak mental condition, and he was restored to his former position, but he never went back to the oil regions.<sup>3</sup>

The memoirs of John S. Duss (1860-1951), who served as the Harmony Society's senior trustee from 1892 to 1903, include this passage about his one-time guardian Lenz:

During the early years of Jonathan's visits to the timber tracts of Warren County, he became acquainted with a young and lovely woman with whom he fell deeply in love. The attachment between the two was so strong and tender, and the conflicting emotions in Jonathan's heart between the love of his brethren of the Society and the love of this woman that for a time it somewhat affected his sanity.

Baker and Henrici, and also my mother, extended all their kindness and prayerful advice to win him back to Economy.<sup>4</sup>

Commenting on the *Pittsburgh Leader's* allegations, Karl J. R. Arndt (1903-91) wrote in 1972:

This story to date has not been verified and may be entirely fictional, because Lenz's letters show a deep devotion to the ideals and beliefs of the Society. He was much loved and highly respected. It seems unlikely that a man of his character and in such an exposed position would have become involved in this manner.<sup>5</sup>

While continuing work on the *Documentary History of the Harmony Society* which Arndt was unable to complete, <sup>6</sup> I have found several contemporary sources that shed more light on Lenz's alleged love affair and insanity. The following are my transcriptions and explanations of the pertinent texts, <sup>7</sup> most of them autographs in the old German ("Gothic") script.

Two letters which the superintendent of the Western Pennsylvania Hospital for the Insane at Dixmont wrote to R. L. Baker on 27 June and 8 July 1866 respectively have been preserved:

Western Pennsylvania Hospital for the Insane Near Pittsburgh, on P., F. W. & C. Ry. Dixmont, Allegheny Co. Pa. June 27, 1866

R L Baker Esq. Dear Sir

I am requested by my Patient Jonathan Lentz [sic] to write a note to you saying that he is better and expects soon to be well. He was gratified very much with the wine and flowers and takes them as an evidence of friendship from the Society. He is calm and has slept for two nights past quite well and is much improved in consequence. He sends his love to you all.

With kind regards to Mr. Henrici I am yours respectfully

J A Reed. Supt of W P H for the Insane

[Endorsed in Baker's hand:] Letter J. A. Reed June 27./66 [printed letterhead as in the previous letter]

July 8th 1866

R L Baker Esq Dear Sir

Mr. Lenz has been in a very good condition ever since I wrote to you last. He is contented and quite willing to do whatever is for his good. His mind seems to be perfectly clear and calm, and [he] converses on all subjects rationally. He has been out walking several times and last evening took a look over our new buildings with me and was very much pleased. He says if you could come up he would be pleased to see you but thinks the fewer visitors he has for a while the better for him. At the same time he knows your health is too feeble to allow you to take the trip and proposes that he and I should run down to Economy some day and call on you. This however would not work well and might serve to produce a relapse and I tell him "we will let well enough alone."

I think you need have no further uneasiness about him and may from this time on consider him as *restored*! I regard his longer residence here as serving only to confirm the cure.

Yours respectfully
J A Reed MD
Supt of W P H for [the] Insane

[Endorsed in Baker's hand:] Letter Doct. Reed 8 July 1866

Opened in 1862, Dixmont was named in honor of the American philanthropist Dorothea Lynde Dix (1802-87), recently commemorated by a U.S. postage stamp, and it is certainly ironic that in August 1857 Baker and Henrici refused her request for one hundred acres of land on which she hoped to build a hospital for the insane. They considered such a grant the duty of the state of Pennsylvania, to which they gladly paid their taxes. While Reed's letters positively prove that Lenz was a patient in that institution for at least two weeks during which he regained his sanity, they reveal nothing about the specific reason for his confinement and its exact duration. Additional information is, however, available in some other documents. One is a German autograph by Lenz which translates as follows:

Harmony is named the place Inhabited by brethren and those who cannot render obedience obedience must needs leave the town of Harmony's confines Must

5

Must must be be, ——— or or The The bullet That I
Have Seen will Reach him. —
but since your beloved Henrici ci ci

10 Strives for the throne of God move him away away! not only [move him] away, but also do away with him when he sees me again, he will
Want to let it come to

15 a duel, and I would defeat him and annihilate him completely.
if I wanted to do so
J. Lenz [TR]

Quite uncharacteristically for Lenz, his handwriting in the original (see the facsimile accompanying this article) is marked by extreme fluctuations in the size of letters and words. Along with this, the compulsive repetition of certain words and syllables (lines 3, 5-6, 7, 9, 11) and a lack of logical progression are symptomatic of a mind in turmoil. The text offers some clues about the writer's obsession. The first two lines are actually a quotation from stanza three of the Harmonists' favorite hymn "Harmonie, du Bruderstadt [Harmony, thou town of brethren]," authored jointly by George Rapp and his adopted son Frederick (1755-1834).9 Immediately associated with this are unconditional obedience and the penalty of expulsion for those who disobey the society's commands (including that of strict celibacy). The deranged Lenz believes that the only way for him to avoid this penalty is to defeat Henrici, whom he seems to accuse of wanting to usurp God's throne. Recognized as a paragon of Harmonist discipline, Henrici is reported to have decorated the walls of his room exclusively with pictures testifying to "the ruinous influence of woman on man: Adam, Eve, Joseph and Potiphar etc."10 Lenz focuses on Henrici as his personal adversary because it is very likely he who was responsible for putting an end to Lenz's love relationship. Significantly, both letters from Reed to Baker, who was seriously ill during the entire summer of 1866 and could not leave Economy, 11 convey no greetings from Lenz to Henrici. Lenz's opposition to Henrici had existed for some years in connection with the Society's purchase of land in Venango County from the estate of the bankrupt William Davidson Sr. 12 Like many others, Lenz maintained that Henrici, after promising to return this land to Davidson, had decided to keep it when it proved to be rich with oil. Lenz was aware that Henrici's decision caused public opinion in the oil district to turn against the Harmony Society's trustees, and on 9 November 1864 Baker in Economy received an anonymous threatening letter containing a Minié ball. In order to keep it secret, Lenz was asked to carry this letter personally to Henrici in Tidioute.<sup>13</sup> That Minié ball is probably identical with "The bullet That I/Have Seen" (lines 7-8) on which his tormented mind is now fixated in the desperate desire to eliminate Henrici.

Similarly disjointed is a second autograph by Lenz. Translated it reads:

To the entire congregation

Peace be with you I beg
you do not strive against one another
and do not be distressed all will

be set aright, a greeting to
my mother Christina, [who is] with my
brother C[hristian] Lenz. my two little imps
Lisa and Maria are mine, I
frightened them when they tried to lie to me

my mother is supposed to see to that when they

follow me I will kiss them. my
dear friend Fri[e]drich God or rather Goll
not [Frederick] Rapp
Who knows how Economy would have fared
if it had not been for you
I thank you dear friend
Jonathan Lenz. [TR]

In a nonconfrontational mood, Lenz here exhorts his fellow Harmonists to avoid discord and to believe in a harmonious resolution of all (unspecified) difficulties. These underpunctuated lines center on people near and dear to him: his mother Christina (1769-1815), his brother Christina (1804-67), his two children Lisa and Maria, and his friend Friedrich Goll (1809-73). It is striking how Lenz refers to his deceased mother as though she were still alive like his brother, who died on 20 August 1867 in Economy, soon after the recovered Lenz had returned from Dixmont (see below). As far as I can ascertain, it is only in this less than coherent outpouring that his children are ever named.

The time frame of Lenz's confinement at Dixmont as well as its cause can be approximated from Balthaser Casper Henning's letters to Dr. Benjamin Feucht (1834-98), a medical practitioner in Allegheny. Born in 1833, B. C. Henning left Economy in 1854, six months after having attained his legal age. 14 From 1861 until 1870 he was employed as a mechanical foreman at the Harmony Society's Tidioute oil wells. B. C. Henning, his twin-brother Casper, Benjamin Feucht, and the latter's brother Heinrich (1837-1902) were pupils of Henrici, who also became the Feucht brothers' guardian when they were orphaned in 1847. After both Feucht brothers withdrew from the society in 1865, Benjamin Feucht and B. C. Henning maintained a regular correspondence, exchanging critical observations about the society while awaiting the time when its assets might be divided among its last surviving members and their legal heirs. In the following excerpts from Henning's English letters, the faulty grammar and orthography are transcribed exactly as found in the originals. It would seem that he did not avail himself of Henrici's offer to help him, his brother, and the two Feuchts perfect their command of English. 15 On 17 June 1866 Henning wrote to Benjamin Feucht:

Mr. Henrici has not been here to See us Since the last of February nether dose he think that he will be up here for some time. We expect Mr. Lenz here in a few days, he has been up here once Since Mr. Henrici has been.

Things here on this place is going the Same old Way and I have nothing speshel New to write [...]

From another letter<sup>16</sup> we know that it was not Lenz but Henrici who visited Tidioute (where he left shortly before 8 July) in late June of that year and

brought with him the news of Lenz's committal to Dixmont. We may therefore conclude either that on 17 June Lenz was not yet a patient at Dixmont or that word of his presence there had not yet reached Tidioute. Since a railroad connection between Beaver and Tidioute had recently been established<sup>17</sup> (whereas the telegraph line was not completed until September 1866<sup>18</sup>), notification by mail would have taken no more than a day. On 12 August 1866 Henning told Benjamin Feucht, "I understand Mr. L[enz] has returned to E[conomy] again Well." Dated at Zoar in Ohio on 9 August 1866, Jacob Ackermann's letter to R. L. Baker also mentions Lenz's restoration, of which Baker had informed the Zoarites on 3 August. Pointing to Lenz's fate as a warning example for anyone who disregards Christ's words to his disciples in Matthew 26: 41 ("Watch out and pray, that ye enter not into temptation: the spirit indeed is willing, but the flesh is weak."), Ackermann clearly implies that Lenz had been unable to resist the temptations of the flesh.

Henning's letter of 1 October 1866 includes this passage, evidently in response to Feucht's inquiry:

I will now Give you a Short history of the Woman talked of about Mr. L[enz]. Mr. Coutch her Brother in law, was living here on this place and she was living with him doing Washing for the Men emploied her[e] and also for Mr. L[enz] (this is about 5. years ago. or about the time I first lived her and worked hire for the E[conomy] people.[)] The Womans Name is Marey Williams. [She] was then about thirty five years of age. I have always knew that he was very intimat with her while here. and I have always thaught that Mr. H[enrici] Sent the Family away from here for that Reason. I have knowed Mr. L[enz] to take here in the Buggey out to the Sawmill about three miles distant from her to pick Black Berrys. Since the departure of that Family from here I have not knew much about it But I know that while the Family (Coutchs) lived at Oil City, that he. L[enz]. would stop there on his Way up hire, and down. the[y] are formerly from Indiana County near Ebensburg, where her Miss Williams Father now lives and very likely she is at home. I am therfor pretty Shure, that at the time he. [[onathan] L[enz] ran away from Esconomy] that he was bound on his way there to Williams. which is the right way Via Blairsville, this is about all I know about the Story going around, there for I have Considered that he was Woman struck, and nothing else would perfectly Cure him but a Wife. that I would Consider the best Medical advice for him.

So far I have been unable to obtain more conclusive information about Mary Williams, her family, and the Coutches. It is possible that the latter are related to S. L. Couch of West Lebanon, who wrote to R. L. Baker on 29 January 1866 on behalf of his son, recently returned from the Union army and now tending

a store for a firm in Oil City. According to the letter, this son as well as a Sarah Couch were debtors of the Harmony Society. Records in the Forest County courthouse in Tionesta show that on 9 May 1888 Henry Pilgrim Holt, a medical doctor, and Mary Margaret Williams were married by Rev. Steadman at her mother's home in East Hickory in Forest County, eight miles south of Tidioute. It is quite conceivable that she was the daughter of Jonathan Lenz and the Mary Williams referred to by B. C. Henning and later by Heinrich Feucht. Mary Margaret Williams was born on 1 August 1865 at Tidioute, nine months after Lenz had returned there in order to deliver to Henrici the above-mentioned anonymous letter containing a Minié ball. Henrici's response to R. L. Baker is dated 14 November 1864 and proves that Henrici received the minacious letter, along with Baker's initial reaction to it, on 12 November. According to T. R. Hennon's letters to Baker and Henrici, dated 4 and 15 December 1864, Lenz stayed in Tidioute until 8 December of that year.

Contrary to the *Pittsburgh Leader's* assertion quoted above, Lenz eventually did return to the oil region, but not until 1869, by then as the Society's junior trustee. On 19 October of that year Henning informed Feucht, "Mrss. H[enrici] & L[enz] arrived here last Thursday [i.e., 14 October], Henrici and [Michael] Killinger returned home [to Economy] the day following, Friday last. Mr. Lenz is here Staying a few Weeks, aparently taking a General look at Matters." And on 12 December Henning reported to Feucht, "Mr. Lenz pays us regular Visits Now in place of Mr. H[enrici]." This statement is confirmed by subsequent letters from Henning to Feucht. Whether Lenz had altogether renounced his love for Mary Williams (or another woman) would, however, seem questionable in light of this fragment he recorded in his letter book between two other entries dated 22 and 25 January 1869 respectively:

## Dear Madam

I have longed for the day which again would furnish me with an opportunity of expressing to you, how highly I esteem you, and how fervent are the wishes which I intertain for your happiness. I am not given to the making of fine phrases, nor do fine phrases express the sentiments of the hart, and I know know that you you are the objets of my daily daily

The substantial accuracy of Henning's relation of 1 October 1866 is corroborated by Heinrich Feucht (also known as Henry Feicht). Unlike his elder brother Benjamin, Heinrich after leaving Economy was unable to find a satisfactory and steady livelihood for himself and his family. Regarded by some as a spendthrift and failure, he addressed to Henrici a long apologia on New Year's Day 1881. The following account is part of it.

Since you accused me so severely, the last time I visited you, of being a gossip and a prodigal etc., I want to offer you my written defense. I do not deny that I ever said those things, but one must always make a distinction between truth and falsehood, and now I want to tell you the real truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God. Twenty years ago, when Jacob Goll<sup>19</sup> and I were asked to take a team of oxen from Economy to Tidioute, we stopped at an inn named Plumer House, and when we were having supper a man asked us whether we were not from Economy. When both of us said that we were, he started to tell us that we were headed for the Economy Oil Wells in time for a big wedding where Jonathan Lenz would marry a woman by the name of Mary Williams, etc. But being a zealous member of the Harmony Society at that time, I told the man this must be a slanderous lie and I would stake my life on that. Still he insisted that the facts would bear him out. And when we arrived at the Wells, I mentioned to Balthaser Henning what the man had told us. And Balthaser told us, "You've got eyes for seeing and ears for hearing, and that's all I'll say." And after we had been there for a day, Lenz took us to a house in which there were two women, and he introduced us, "Those are my Economy boys etc." And if we had any laundry to be done we should give it to them. And if we felt like it, we could stay with them. Since the man of the house was on an errant for Henrici, [Lenz said] the women would be afraid of being alone. But Jacob Goll expressed no inclination to accept that invitation, and I said I would rather sleep in a cold bed in Bimber's<sup>20</sup> old shanty. And when we got up the next morning, we didn't find Lenz in his bed, and when we asked him whether he had the nightwatch he told us, "No, I stayed with the two women who were so terribly afraid." And when soon afterwards Jacob Goll had to marry his wife, he told the entire story to Catharina Baker, 21 who told R. L. Baker. And later when Lenz became deranged and had to go to Dixmont, R. L. Baker had me come from Bridgewater and asked me about this story. And when I had told him everything exactly as I have now described it for you, he asked me to kindly keep it to myself, and I promised to do so. However, when Magdalena Merkle<sup>22</sup> was looking after Helena [Reichert], 23 she told [Michael] Killinger<sup>24</sup> that Lenz had taken Mary Williams to her home in a small buggy, and Killinger then told others. He had also heard the whole story from Goll, and later I was said to be the source of that scandalous story. And now I am prepared to testify in a court of law that I was falsely blamed. I myself had a conversation about this matter with him [Lenz], as did my wife, but the only thing he said was that he would never in his life forgive me-which does not show much Christianity. When you Harmonists pray in church, you always say, "And forgive us our trespasses as we forgive those who trespass against us." But if I were in his position, I would fear that the Righteous Judge, with Whom there is no respect of persons and Who does not ask us whence we come but whither we are going, will say to me, "Inasmuch as ye have done it unto one of the least of these of my brethren, ye have done it unto me, etc." [TR]

That Heinrich Feucht remembered so much so vividly after almost twenty years is quite plausible, considering the unusual nature of his and Jacob Goll's experiences on their first visit to Tidioute. Thanks to a series of letters their and Lenz's activities at that time are well documented.<sup>25</sup> On 26 November 1861 Feucht and Goll set out from Economy with a wagon and a team of oxen that were badly needed for hauling heavy equipment and clearing land at the society's oil wells. Because of the atrocious weather and singularly bad roads the two young teamsters' progress was difficult and slow. With the wagon and a rented team of horses Heinrich Feucht reached Tidioute on 4 December, while Goll and the unshod oxen arrived there the next day. Thus it had taken the two young travelers nine and ten days respectively to cover about 120 miles. From a letter Heinrich Feucht wrote to Baker and Henrici in Franklin at noon on 2 December, it follows that he and Goll stopped over at Plumer House<sup>26</sup> that night. Without the draft animals and wagon they departed from Tidioute on 16 December and returned by steamboat to Economy on 19 December.

Supervision of many mechanical installations in the initial stages of the Harmony Society's oil production necessitated Lenz's continuous presence in the Tidioute area. By the middle of August 1861 Lenz had been away from Economy for an entire year but insisted that his prolonged absence was still necessary to ensure the orderly operation of the wells.<sup>27</sup> Baker's frail health required Henrici's attention to business matters in Economy. The then rather circuitous railway connection between Economy and Tidioute (from Beaver via Cleveland and Erie to Irvine, then by stage or sleigh to Tidioute) as well as the lack of comfortable living quarters for the Harmonists and their help also made Henrici's visits to the area infrequent. Until the Society completed its own dwelling at Tidioute in December 1864, boarding houses were used for less than the communal living enjoyed at Economy.<sup>28</sup> Before construction began on an even bigger building in 1866, B. C. Henning offered this crude conjecture to Benjamin Feucht: "I have not heard any thing about the Economy people going to Build a large house here nor that the[y] were going to Move up here to Warren County. Very likely L[en]z would like to act the Stu[d] H[orse] among them Mades you see."29 All the circumstances still prevailing at Tidioute in 1861 seem to have conspired to lead Lenz into temptation. On 29 November he arrived there by the above-mentioned train and stage route. If one compares Lenz's written account of his activities during the next few days with that of Heinrich Feucht, a curious discrepancy emerges. In his letter of 4 December 1861 to R. L. Baker, Lenz reports that he had gone to Oil Creek (now Oil City) to look for Heinrich Feucht and Jacob Goll. After finding Goll and the two oxen one mile below Oil Creek, Lenz claims to have returned to Tidioute, where

he arrived on the evening of 3 December. Heinrich Feucht, however, states in his letter to Baker dated 9 December that Lenz met Goll on the morning of 4 December, who promptly sent word of that meeting to Feucht. If a wedding between Lenz and Mary Williams actually took place (as announced by the unidentified stranger in Plumer House, according to Heinrich Feucht's recollection in 1881), it could have been on 3 December 1861, possibly in Oil City. Unfortunately, since marriage licenses were not required in Pennsylvania until 1885, the county courts have no records of earlier marriages. Pleading urgent business as his reason for remaining in Tidioute over Christmas (in his letter to R. L. Baker, 23 December 1861), Lenz this time did not return to Economy before the middle of January, as evidenced by his letter of 9 January 1862 and Joseph Stevert's letter to R. L. Baker of 2 February 1862.

Heinrich Feucht's 1881 letter to Henrici shows how Lenz's secret liaison with Mary Williams was soon divulged to certain Harmonists in Economy, including R. L. Baker, who evidently did not pursue the matter until 1866. Although it is impossible to date precisely the several ways in which the story spread, Henry Feucht's references to Jacob Goll allow us to determine a terminus ante quem. When Mary Eisenbraun confessed that he was the father of her illegitimate child born on 22 December 1861, she and Goll were asked to leave Economy—the customary punishment for all probationary and regular members of the Harmony Society. Goll signed his release on 27 January 1862, the day of his departure. From the two newspaper items cited at the beginning of this paper, it is clear that Lenz's love affair and subsequent insanity also became known to outsiders, even if some of the details transmitted were changed in the process. And while Heinrich Feucht's denial of charges that he was responsible for spreading such knowledge may be justified, his brother Benjamin was less discreet. According to an anonymous German letter addressed to Lenz and dated Pittsburgh, 17 April 1875, Dr. Feucht had stated at various occasions "that you [Lenz] have a wife and children and therefore went to Dixmont, whither (he hopes) you will soon return." [TR]

Why was Jonathan Lenz exempted from the customary penalty of expulsion when his secret affair with Mary Williams became known to some Harmonists? Reports which, according to Heinrich Feucht, circulated in early 1862 were evidently ignored by the ailing Baker, who was already grooming Lenz for a trusteeship. When Lenz's affair came to light later and was promptly terminated by Henrici, Lenz's spell of insanity during the summer of 1866 must have lent itself to the convenient rationalization that his transgression had been an infatuation brought on by his deranged mind. And since Christ had treated such individuals as possessed by the devil, hence not accountable for any deeds done while mente captus, the Harmonists could do no less. Such an explanation of Lenz's lapse would of course have been far more expedient than convincing, but one must remember that the Harmony Society's leaders considered themselves privileged stewards in the biblical tradition (2 Kings 12:15 and 22:7) who were only as accountable to their membership as they chose to be, and that

expediency prevailed over principle and truth at several important junctures in the Society's history. 30 When Baker died on 11 January 1868, membership had dwindled to 140, and while Lenz's subsequent performance as junior trustee of the rapidly senescent society may have justified Baker's pragmatism, it could not obliterate the memory of Lenz's illicit love affair that had led to his temporary insanity in the first place. For critical contemporaries this constituted living proof of the society's persistent double standard: one for its members and another for its leaders.

Wilfrid Laurier University Waterloo, Ontario

## Notes

Aaron Williams, The Harmony Society, at Economy, Penna. (Pittsburgh: W. S. Haven, 1866), 99-101.

<sup>2</sup> In an anonymous article entitled "A Prominent Economite," dated 24 Jan. 1890 and preserved in the Arndt Collection as a clipping from an unidentified newspaper.

<sup>3</sup> From the article "A Queer People," The Pittsburgh Leader, 10 August 1890. This is the second of two articles under that title, the first having appeared one week earlier.

<sup>4</sup> John S. Duss, The Harmonists: A Personal History (Harrisburg: Pennsylvania Book Service, 1943), 108.

<sup>5</sup> Karl J. R. Arndt, "The Pittsburgh Leader's Analysis of the 1890 Crisis in the Harmony Society and Its International Repercussions," Western Pennsylvania Historical Magazine 55 (1972): 339.

<sup>6</sup> The eight volumes (including one that appeared posthumously) published by Arndt 1975-94

cover the Harmony Society's history up to January 1868.

Unless otherwise specified, all documents cited are originals or copies in the Arndt Collection currently on loan to me. Upon completion of the Documentary History of the Harmony Society, the Collection will have a permanent place at the University of Southern Indiana in Evansville. TR indicates my own translations from German originals.

8 R. L. Baker and Jacob Henrici to Dorothy Lynde Dix, 10 Aug. 1857.

- 9 Cf. Karl J. R. Arndt, George Rapp's Harmony Society, 1785-1847 (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1865), 266. Six of the hymn's twelve stanzas, including the third, are translated in Duss (see n. 4) 417-18.
- 10 Karl J. R. Arndt, George Rapp's Successors and Material Heirs, 1847-1916 (Rutherford: Fairleigh Dickinson UP, 1971), 120.

Jacob Henrici to Louise Weil, 10 Sept. 1866.

<sup>12</sup> The transactions and their repercussions, including litigation, are a subject of considerable complexity that deserves to be treated in a separate article. Arndt's account in George Rapp's Successors and Material Heirs (see n. 10) 70-82 relies exclusively on the Harmony Society trustees' version of the events.

<sup>13</sup> Mentioned in Lenz's undated reply to R. L. Baker's letter of 10 June 1867.

<sup>14</sup> Arndt includes him as a member in his posthumously published book George Rapp's Disciples: Pioneers and Heirs: A Register of the Harmonists in America, ed. Donald E. Pitzer and Leigh Ann Chamness (Evansville: U of Southern Indiana P, 1994), 107. Although born in the Society as the son of member parents, Henning was never a member himself. A statement he signed on 11 Sept. 1854 shows that he left Economy before completing the customary probationary period.

<sup>15</sup> Jacob Henrici to B. C. and Casper Henning, 11 April 1854. Magdalena and Wilhelmina Merkle to R. L. Baker, 8 July 1866. <sup>17</sup> Magdalena and Wilhelmina Merkle to R. L. Baker, 3 June 1866.

18 Jacob Henrici to R. L. Baker, 24 Sept. 1866.

<sup>19</sup> Born in 1841, he was asked to leave Economy soon after his return from Tidioute. R. L. Baker's letter to Lenz, dated 24 Dec. 1861, shows that Goll was never a member of the Harmony Society. Nevertheless Arndt's *George Rapp's Disciples* (see n. 14), 99, lists him as a member.

<sup>20</sup> Lewis Bimber, a nonmember employed at the Harmony Society's oil wells, was serving in

the Union army at this time.

<sup>21</sup> Actually Catharina Langenbacher (1800-74), sister of Gottlieb Romelius Langenbacher, who

Anglicized his name into R. L. Baker to facilitate his function in the business world.

<sup>22</sup> A nonmember, she came to Economy shortly after 30 Sept. 1861 to care for the bedridden Helena Reichert until the end of 1863. Magdalena's mother, Wilhelmina Merkle in Tidioute, was a niece of Frederick Rapp.

<sup>23</sup> A chronically invalid Harmonist (1827-67) who required constant nursing care in Economy.

<sup>24</sup> A Harmonist (1805-77) characterized elsewhere as a notorious busybody.

<sup>25</sup> Jacob Henrici to John B. Nichol, 25 Nov. 1861; Henry Feucht to Baker and Henrici, 2 Dec. 1861; Jonathan Lenz to R. L. Baker, 4 Dec. 1861; Jonathan Lenz to R. L. Baker, 6 Dec. 1861; Jacob Goll to friends and acquaintances in Economy, 9 Dec. 1861; Jonathan Lenz to R. L. Baker, 16 Dec. 1861; Jonathan Lenz to R. L. Baker, 19 Dec. 1861; R. L. Baker to Jonathan Lenz, 20 Dec. 1861.

<sup>26</sup> In his letter to Henrici, dated 6 March 1855, Jonathan Lenz reports that he walked from Franklin to Plumer House, then took a sleigh to Tidioute and arrived there at 6:00 p.m. on the same

day.

<sup>27</sup> Jonathan Lenz to R. L. Baker, 17 July and 13 Aug. 1861.

<sup>28</sup> Jonathan Lenz to R. L. Baker, 20 Nov. 1860.

<sup>29</sup> B. C. Henning to Benjamin Feucht, 7 Apr. 1866.

<sup>30</sup> For examples besides the above-mentioned contentious issue of the oil-rich lands acquired from William Davidson Sr., see Karl J. R. Arndt, "A Pious Fraud: Rapp's 1805 Harmony Society Articles of Association," *Western Pennsylvania Historical Magazine* 68 (1985): 277-86; Karl J. R. Arndt, comp. and ed., *George Rapp's Years of Glory: Economy on the Ohio, 1834-1847*, George Rapp's Third Harmony: A Documentary History (New York: Lang, 1987), 899-900.