John B. Frantz

Early German Methodism in America

Methodism normally is not associated with German settlers in America.[1] Its eighteenth-century leaders, John and Charles Wesley, were Englishmen. For many decades, Methodism existed as a society within the Church of England. In America, Methodism seemed to appeal to people of English or at least British descent.

In time, however, Methodism developed a significant following among German-Americans as well. In fact, two denominations emerged among them during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries that had much in common with the English Methodists: the Church of the United Brethren in Christ that claimed the German Reformed minister Philip William Otterbein as its founder and the Evangelical Association that formed in the aftermath of the ministry of the former German Lutheran Jacob Albright. Several capable historians have written in detail about these two groups.[2]

What has received even less attention is that simultaneously Methodists, themselves, were conducting a mission to the Germans in America under the leadership of a Methodist bishop. Most descriptions of American Methodism that mention the German immigrants emphasize the Ohio Conference's appropriation of $100.00 to William Nast in 1835 as the beginning of Methodism's German work.[3] One scholar even entitled his study of Nast "Patriarch of German Methodism."[4] It may be that after 1835 an exclusively German Methodism developed on a significant scale under Nast's leadership. Nevertheless, the point of this essay is that there was a German Methodism that emerged long before 1835;[5] indeed, the origins of German Methodism in America actually go back as far as the late eighteenth and very early nineteenth centuries.

It is no wonder that Methodism appealed so early to the German immigrants in America. The religious movement known as Pietism had influenced both the early Methodists and at least some of the German settlers.[6] The Wesleys became acquainted with the pietistic Moravians on their journey to America and during their ministry in Georgia during the mid-1730s. The German "Moravian" Peter Boehler preached at the Aldersgate Chapel in

1738 when John Wesley felt his heart was "strangely warmed."[7] Shortly thereafter, Wesley "walked across Europe" to the Moravian "community at Herrnhut where he absorbed more of pietism's spirit."[8]

The similarities between German Pietism and English Methodism, as it emerged under John Wesley's leadership, gave Wesley's American missionaries entrée to the German settlers. Methodists emphasized Pietism's basic theme of experiential religion, that Christians must know Christ as their personal savior. Like most Pietists, Methodists were universalists in believing that Christ died not only for the so-called "elect" but for all people. Although both stressed salvation by God's grace through faith, they were "Arminians" in stressing human freedom to accept, reject, and "fall from grace." Neither Pietists nor Methodists were satisfied with a mere intellectual profession of Christianity but insisted that Christians live pious lives.[9] Pietists developed the practice of organizing seemingly truly pious church members into small classes for Bible study, mutual encouragement, and fellowship,[10] a practice that Methodists adopted and adapted with much success. Not content to be passive, Pietists were evangelistic, often in unorthodox ways, especially the more radical ones. This also became characteristic of the early Methodists, both in England and in America.[11]

Shortly after Methodists arrived in America, they began to express their concern for the German settlers. The most important of Wesley's missionaries to America was Francis Asbury who entered the British colonies at the port of Philadelphia in 1771.[12] A German convert to Methodism claimed that Asbury had a "great love" for the Germans, that he "always loved the Germans," and that he continued throughout his ministry to feel the "deepest interest in the welfare of the Germans."[13] Asbury described the "poor Germans" of Pennsylvania as "sheep without a shepherd."[14] Even where there were pastors and churches for the Germans, Asbury was concerned. In Reading and Adamstown, Pennsylvania, he observed that the "fine new churches" for the German Reformed and Lutherans were "citadels of formality-fortifications erected against the apostolic itinerancy of a more evangelical ministry."[15] They were not the only offenders. Asbury complained: "Ah! Philadelphia, and ye, her dependencies, the villages of the state of Pennsylvania, when will prejudice, formality, and bigotry cease to deform your religious profession, and the ostentatious display of lesser morals give place to evangelical piety?"[16]

A few weeks before Asbury died in 1816, he wrote to his colleague in the ministry, William McKendree, about what he called the "acute need" for Methodist missions to the Germans. This work, he insisted "must not be taken up and put down lightly."[17] He was anxious about the German settlers' spiritual condition. In 1803, Asbury confided to his journal, "I have felt for thirty-two years for Pennsylvania—the most wealthy and the most careless about God and the things of God; but I hope God will shake the state and the churches."[18] Asbury charged that the German preachers and people were "too

fond of settling and having things established on a regular plan." He believed that a "traveling [itinerant] ministry would be more productive of good among these people . . . ."[19] He appealed for more missionaries, more hymnals, and copies of the "Methodist Discipline for the Germans." If the Germans would not buy the books, he urged that they be distributed to them free of charge.[20]

Asbury initiated a Methodist mission to the German settlers immediately after his arrival in America. In 1772, he met the pietistic German Reformed minister Benedict Schwob to whom in early 1774 he "opened the plan of Methodism."[21] In order to implement the plan, he wrote to Philip William Otterbein, another pietistic German Reformed clergyman who was serving a congregation in what Asbury called "Little York," in the colony of Pennsylvania.[22] He wanted Otterbein to serve a German Reformed congregation in Baltimore, in the colony of Maryland, and to organize classes of committed people who would study, pray, and testify together, as he was doing among the English-speaking colonists. Asbury and Schwob agreed that they would "persevere" in this plan even if the Reformed authorities objected.[23] Reformed Church officials acquiesced in Otterbein's move. Otterbein subsequently organized pietistic German Reformed colleagues into the "United Ministers" who set up classes in the Pipe Creek area of Maryland, northwest of Baltimore.[24] The War for American Independence interrupted Otterbein's efforts. When the war ended, however, Otterbein resumed his pietistic evangelism with the former Mennonite Martin Boehm, whom he had embraced after a service in "Long's Barn," near Neffsville in Pennsylvania, many years earlier. Otterbein and Boehm joined with other Mennonite and Reformed preachers in what they called the Society of the United Brethren in Christ.[25] Asbury's and Otterbein's similarities enabled them to become such close friends that Asbury asked Otterbein to participate in his consecration as co-superintendent of American Methodists when they separated from the Church of England in 1784. When Otterbein died in 1813, Asbury preached at a memorial service for him.[26]

As early as 1781, Asbury recognized the need for Methodist preachers who were proficient in the German language. He predicted that if "we could get a Dutch preacher or two to travel with us, I am persuaded we should have a good work among the Dutch."[27] In time, the Methodists did attract men of German background who became itinerant preachers, including, among others, John Schwartzelder, William Folks, Joseph and Christian Fry, Henry Weidner, John Hagerty, Peter Beaver, Henry Crum, Moses Henkel, Casper Yost, Simon Miller, Jacob Gruber, and Henry Boehm. Not much is known about some of these men. For example, Asbury notes only that Weidner and Hagerty accompanied him to Virginia in 1781.[28] Beaver is listed in the minutes of the Methodist Conference of 1810 as a "German missionary" in the Chester, Pennsylvania, District.[29] He preached also in Schuylkill County, Pennsylvania, where he shared a "preaching place" with Jacob Albright. Crum, who preached for the United Brethren also, labored among the Germans in the

Shenandoah Valley of Virginia, as did ex-Lutheran Moses Henkel. Yost "wielded strong influence in Southwestern Virginia." [30] More is known of Simon Miller and Jacob Gruber. Miller, native of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, became an itinerant preacher in 1791 and labored in Delaware and Pennsylvania until his death in 1795.[31] A man described as having "genuine piety, deep experience, and useful gifts," he attracted "large crowds" to his ministry and influenced especially Boehm and Gruber. Boehm called Miller Gruber's "spiritual father." [32]

Gruber was another Pennsylvania German whose biographer described him as having had the "peculiar characteristics of that people which clung to him with wondrous tenacity." [33] Boehm noted along a similar vein that his colleague was a "fine, intelligent looking man, and his countenance expressed a thing before his tongue uttered it. He had a German face and a German tongue." More to the point, Boehm claimed that a "bolder soldier of the cross never wielded the 'sword of the spirit.'" As a preacher, Boehm wrote, "he was original and eccentric." He served in Pennsylvania, Virginia, Maryland, and New York.[34]

Henry Boehm was the most prominent of the early German Methodist preachers. He was the son of Martin Boehm, Otterbein's associate, who was a leader of the United Brethren but also a Methodist. Henry Boehm was admitted to "full connection and ordained" in 1802.[35] Initially, he was assigned to serve in Delaware where he became a vigorous opponent of slavery, but returned to his native state in 1803. In 1807, he was assigned to a circuit that was labeled simply "Pennsylvania," including the entire area between the Delaware and Susquehanna rivers. He was to preach in German to his countrymen. Because Boehm was able to do so when so few Methodists could, Asbury named him his traveling companion in 1808, a position he held until 1813 when Asbury returned him to the Pennsylvania Germans. Boehm claimed that he had covered forty thousand miles with Asbury, and that throughout his itinerancy he traveled one hundred thousand miles on horseback into fourteen states.[36] Of the German-speaking Methodist preachers, Asbury predicted that "thousands will hear our Gospel by these men." [37]

The Methodist Asbury and his growing group of itinerant preachers carried their message into areas where the German colonists had settled. Robert Strawbridge, one of the first Methodist circuit riders, included heavily German Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, in his travels.[38] Although the Methodists had difficulty in establishing a society in the city, possibly because it was well-churched, they returned repeatedly to the county.[39] The home of Martin Boehm was one of their "favorite stopping places."[40] Strawbridge preached there at least as early as 1781.[41] Strawbridge's efforts might have been partially responsible for what Asbury described in that year as "a great work among the Germans towards Lancaster." [42] Other early Methodist itinerants also preached there. Later, in 1801, a chapel was erected on

Boehm's land to house their services.[43] Asbury held forth frequently in "Boehm's Chapel" and preached there the funeral sermon for Martin Boehm in 1812.[44] Methodist preachers, William McKendree, later to become a bishop, Jessee Lee, Asbury's traveling companion in 1799, and others preached there as well.[45] Lee noted that he had a "very precious season" while preaching in the chapel, that the "power of the Lord was with us: and there were many tears shed by the hearers."[46] As early as 1783, the Methodists added a circuit to provide preaching on a regular basis to that area.[47]

Methodists visited Germans in other parts of Pennsylvania also. The itinerant preacher Freeborn Garrettson introduced Methodism to York in 1781.[48] Asbury went there in the next year, preached to "many hearers in the German schoolhouse," and conferred there with German Reformed ministers Otterbein and Daniel Wagner.[49] As at Boehm's Chapel, Asbury must have felt at home, for he returned frequently.[50] By 1782, the Methodists had appointed three preachers to the place and listed the society there as having 156 members.[51] Henry Boehm went to Harrisburg in 1803, where he noticed that "most of the inhabitants were Germans," which required him to preach "mostly in German."[52] Later Asbury sent him back to Dauphin County to "preach to the Germans."[53] Asbury and his traveling companion went into the Lehigh River Valley where he observed that the "Germans are decent in this neighborhood," and he added that "they would be more so, were it not for vile whiskey."[54] Asbury and other Methodists were active among the Germans in southwestern Pennsylvania, such as in Somerset County and Pittsburgh.[55]

Methodists followed the Pennsylvania Germans to areas to the south and west. Asbury in 1772 went to the Maryland community of Frederick that he described as a "neat little town," the residents of which were "chiefly Germans," where "many people came to hear me."[56] By 1774, a Methodist society had emerged there, and the well-known preachers Strawbridge and Garrettson were appointed to serve it early in its history.[57] Asbury went also to neighboring Hagerstown where he charged that Otterbein's people have "shouldered us out, but have failed to establish themselves."[58] Although Virginia's English settlements in the Tidewater area attracted much Methodist attention, Asbury and other preachers endeavored to reach also into western Virginia's Shenandoah Valley where German settlers lacked clergymen of their own churches. Members of German Reformed congregations there lamented that they "were entirely neglected" and pleaded to their church officials in 1773 to send ordained ministers to them.[59] In 1781, Methodists tried to fill the ministerial void as Asbury and two German-speaking preachers entered the valley. Asbury observed that in the German settlement near Romney the "people love preaching, but they do not understand class meetings because they are not enough conversant with the English tongue."[60] On a later visit, in 1790, to the home of a "pious German, well-settled on a branch of the Shenandoah River," Asbury recorded that he had an "attentive congregation" of Germans.[61] Asbury and others, including McKendree, continued to preach

in the valley towns where Germans lived, such as Winchester, Stephens City, Woodstock, and Harrisonburg. Methodists even held a session of their annual conference in the valley.[62]

As Methodist itinerants traveled to the West, they ministered to Germans in Tennessee, Kentucky, and Ohio. At Brunnerstown, Kentucky, Asbury arranged for "preaching in German and English."[63] In Ohio, Boehm addressed residents of German background who "had not heard preaching in their own tongue since they left their native land."[64] At Xenia, he preached in German to "possibly as many as 2,000" worshippers,[65] and in Cincinnati he delivered what is believed to have been the first sermon in the German language in that city.[66]

Methodists ranged to the north, as well, where they served German settlers in New York. Although Methodism in the province's major city had been founded in 1766 by Palatine Germans who had come to the colony by way of Ireland,[67] Asbury and other Methodists paid at least as much attention to the descendants of earlier Palatine German colonists who eventually settled in the Hudson and Mohawk River valleys.[68] Asbury and his cohorts preached at Kingston on the Hudson where Asbury counted a "good number of Germans present who were permitted to sit near the stand and hear in their own tongue the wonderful works of God." He saw that under German Methodist preaching, the "power of God came down upon the people, and tears flowed down many cheeks . . . ." Garrettson also preached in the Hudson Valley where he observed that the people were "mostly German."[69] In the vicinity of Fort Schuyler also, large congregations of Germans gathered to hear Methodist preaching in their language.[70] The Methodists in that area had organized a society in Herkimer by 1794.[71]

The worship services that the Methodist preachers conducted differed markedly from those led by Lutheran and Reformed pastors who claimed at least the nominal adherence of most of the German settlers. While many of the German "church people" were accustomed to following their churches' liturgies,[72] the Methodists in America had discarded that aspect of their Anglican heritage and worshipped freely. Although Methodist preachers administered the sacraments after Methodism became an American denomination in 1784, they more often preached. Boehm described a service in which the "preachers were at it for five hours without intermission . . . , [worshippers] hearing four sermons in English and one in German . . . ."[73] Such services were not unusual; Christian Newcomer, once a Mennonite and later a United Brethren bishop, observed a Methodist service in Rockingham County in Virginia's Shenandoah Valley that began on one day and continued through the next.[74]

Like other evangelists in rural America, Methodists led camp meetings that went on for days and attracted hundreds and thousands of people. At the Pike Run camp meeting in Washington County in southwestern Pennsylvania, there were "one hundred tents and four or five hundred people encamped on

the ground." At the Sunday services, there "were three thousand people in the grove." Asbury spoke, as did German Methodist preachers Boehm and Gruber.[75] In some of these services, Methodists cooperated with preachers of other groups, often United Brethren. At "Fishing Creek," a "Methodist Brother" followed Otterbein on the platform.[76] At another service, Newcomer "preached in German; Brother Lucas, a Methodist preacher, in the English language."[77]

People who attended Methodist services, especially the "big meetings," often became visibly emotional. Early American Methodist historian Nathan Bangs justified such behavior by writing that "there never was any remarkable revival of religion, but . . . wildfire mixed with sacred flame."[78] After German Methodist Gruber's prayer at a "quarterly meeting in a barn" in New York state, the "people simultaneously sprang to their feet, while shouts of joy and cries for mercy filled the place. Many fell to the floor, and others were filled with fear and fled in the greatest consternation."[79] Newcomer wrote in his journal that at a similar Methodist meeting his "heart was truly rejoiced to see the people crying, shouting, and jumping."[80]

These actions created a bad impression of the Methodists among some Germans, causing the label "Methodist" to become a term of derision. German Lutherans in York condemned their pastor for permitting Garrettson to preach to them.[81] Philip Schaff, church historian at the German Reformed theological seminary then at Mercersburg, Pennsylvania, charged that Methodist worship made a "frivolous mockery of all religion." The "revivals" that sometimes followed Methodist worship, he compared with a "quick straw fire." There was too much of what he considered "human and impure" in them to suit him. He worried that Methodist worship "nourished a most dangerous distrust of the ordinary means of grace, the calm preaching of the Word, the sacraments, the catechetical instruction."[82]

Actually, Methodists tried to appeal not only to the Germans' feelings but also to their minds. Methodist circuit riders were seldom without religious books and tracts in their saddlebags.[83] As Asbury was traveling in southwestern Pennsylvania, near Connellsville, he handed to the people whom he met "a religious tract in German or English."[84] After the General Conference in 1808, Boehm returned to have printed in the German language a pamphlet on the "Characteristics of a true Methodist or Christian" and the sermon entitled "Awake thou that sleepest" which he later distributed to the Germans. Boehm believed that the German language tracts "did immense good," for he believed that "they often went where the preacher could not go."[85]

Even more significant was the translation of the "Methodist Discipline" into German in 1808. Asbury and members of the Philadelphia Conference asked that it be done, and Boehm "employed Dr. [Ignatz] Romer" for the task.[86] Romer was a German-speaking Swiss who was "educated for the priesthood," who became "awakened, [and] joined the Methodist Church."[87]

Boehm aided Romer in the translation, employed the printers and paid them, and examined all the proof sheets and attended to the distribution of the books after they were printed. He "sent several hundreds of them in a box to Cincinnati to be distributed gratuitously among the Germans in the West; others circulated about Pennsylvania." According to Boehm, the "translation was an admirable one" and was "very useful; . . . enabling the Germans to read in their mother tongue our excellent discipline." In that the "Discipline" stated clearly Methodist history, doctrines, and precisely how the Methodists were expected to behave, it was helpful also in correcting the impression of some Germans that the Methodists lacked discipline.[88]

Although the early American Methodists' efforts among the German immigrants were effective, they might have been more so if the Methodists had been more prompt, aggressive, and astute. Despite Asbury's professions of interest, Methodists were in America for nearly two decades before they recruited a consistent German-speaking preacher, in the person of Simon Miller, specifically for this work.[89] It was not until late in Asbury's life that he proposed a systematic plan for ministry to the Germans.[90] Even when the Methodists attracted German-speaking preachers, they seemed oblivious initially to the German preachers' potential usefulness among other Germans. They were not appointed immediately or consistently to minister in areas that Germans had settled. Miller served briefly in Delaware,[91] as did Boehm.[92] Gruber ministered for several years to the Light Street congregation in Baltimore that was not particularly German.[93] Joseph and Christopher Fry were Germans from Winchester, Virginia, who became Methodist preachers "but not preaching in that language," they lost the ability to use it.[94]

Contemporary United Brethren and Evangelical as well as later Methodist missions to the Germans suggest that a Methodist ministry directed more specifically to the Germans during this period might have been more helpful. The German-speaking preacher John Dreisbach of the "Albright people" claimed that he made the organization of specifically German societies, circuits, and conferences a condition of his becoming a German Methodist preacher when Asbury invited him in 1810. Asbury, he charged, rejected his suggestion, saying that it was not "expedient." As a result, German settlers who became Methodists had to join congregations with people of other nationalities.[95] Asbury seems to have assumed that German immigrants would adjust quickly to the dominant English culture, as, indeed, some already had. Boehm, for example, began his ministry knowing little English and within a decade had become proficient.[96] Many others, however, were slow to do so, and nineteenth-century immigration reinforced their perseverance in the use of the German language.

Of course, Asbury had no way of knowing that large-scale immigration from Germany would resume after the end of the Napoleonic Wars in 1815. Schaff observed on his mid-century visit to Europe that the "rage for emigration" was spreading "through all parts of Germany and all the Cantons

of Switzerland." According to Schaff, the German Society of New York identified over 32,500 immigrants to that city in the month of May in the year 1853.[97] Consequently, the Germans' transition to the English language took longer than Asbury anticipated.

Greater cooperation with German religious groups that shared Methodist characteristics would have reduced the duplication of effort and provided a more unified witness. (Recent leaders of these groups must have thought so too, for they united their churches in 1968.[98]) In retrospect, the differences seem to have been slight. The Otterbein and Albright groups so closely resembled each other and the denomination that Asbury led that the former were called "German Methodists."[99] Asbury's interest in providing preaching in German indicates that language alone was not the barrier.[100] More divisive were ecclesiastical issues. Otterbein's followers were organized comparatively loosely.[101] United Brethren preachers could "ride a circuit or let it alone," as Asbury complained. They could serve as itinerant preachers or settle in a particular community. Asbury and Albright insisted on an itinerant ministry.[102] Such relative informality characterized the United Brethren's use of titles and offices as well. Asbury assumed the title and role of bishop, but Otterbein, Martin Boehm, and Newcomer wore the title lightly and used a bishop's authority only to ordain successors. As a result, the early United Brethren had no strong leader. To Asbury, they seemed to lack the discipline that he and others admired in Methodism.[103]

Albright and his followers seemed closer to the Methodists, except that they elected bishops for four-year terms instead of for life. Nevertheless, Asbury was not well acquainted with them. In fact, even the editors of the 1958 edition of Asbury's papers could not identify Albright correctly, calling him "Peter," instead of Jacob.[104] Methodists influenced Albright and his followers much more than the United Brethren. In fact, Albright became a Methodist for a short time after he experienced conversion. Albright preached a pietistic Christianity with a Methodist emphasis that included the Wesleyan interpretation of Arminianism and perfectionism. The Evangelical Association's statement of beliefs and practices was little more than another translation of the "Methodist Discipline."[105] When Albright's followers coalesced after his death, initially they adopted the name, the "Newly Organized Methodist Conference."[106] Although there were attempts during the early nineteenth century to bring these groups together, they failed because the participants on all sides lacked sufficient motivation and flexibility.[107]

Nevertheless, the Methodists in America did conduct an intensive ministry to the Germans during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, much sooner than most previous historians have indicated. In their emphasis on experiential religion, they had much in common with pietistic German immigrants to begin with. Evangelistic as the Methodists were, they expressed concern for the Germans shortly after their arrival and carried their ministry into areas where the German immigrants settled, especially in outlying areas

that were not yet served regularly by German Lutheran and Reformed clergymen. When German-speaking Methodist preachers emerged, eventually Methodist officials sent them among the Germans to preach in their own language. In this way, the Methodists provided spiritual nurture for people who preferred their particular interpretation of Protestant Christianity and for those who had little of any type. Exactly how many settlers of German background the Methodists served or added to their rolls is impossible to determine; however, the number probably was large. As a result, American Methodism became more ethnically diverse than its British counterpart and more so than most of its contemporaries in early American Protestantism. Because Asbury refused to provide an exclusively German Methodism, German converts were integrated with those of other ethnic backgrounds which constituted a precedent that American Methodists expanded later. Integration with English-speaking Methodists in classes where confessions were made and testimonies of faith were offered undoubtedly helped the German settlers to shake off some of their ethnic provincialism, to become better acquainted with their British neighbors, and to become better adjusted to life in America.

After the mid-1830s, William Nast and others led a more exclusively German, more intellectually sophisticated, and more numerically successful work among the Germans, but they were not the first. More than a half-century earlier, Francis Asbury and the Methodists of his day had begun that work.

Pennsylvania State University
University Park, Pennsylvania

Notes

[1] Portions of this essay were presented to the American Society of Church History at its centennial convention at Lancaster Theological Seminary, Lancaster, PA, on 14 April 1988.

[2] For recent accounts, see Paul R. Fetters, ed., *Trials and Triumphs: A History of the Church of the United Brethren in Christ* (Huntington, Indiana: Church of the United Brethren in Christ, Department of Church Services, 1984) and Paul H. Eller and J. Bruce Behney, *The History of the Evangelical United Brethren Church*, ed. Kenneth W. Kruegler (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1979); others include A. W. Drury, *History of the Church of the United Brethren in Christ* (Dayton: Otterbein Press, 1924) and Raymond F. Albright, *A History of the Evangelical Church* (Harrisburg: The Evangelical Press, 1942) [Raymond F. Albright was a direct descendant of Jacob Albright]; see also Steven O'Malley, *Pilgrimage of Faith: The Legacy of the Otterbeins* (Metuchen, New Jersey: Scarecrow Press, 1973), 175-84; Paul C. Milhouse, *Philip William Otterbein: Pioneer Pastor to Germans in America* (Nashville: The Upper Room, 1968), 51-54; Arthur C. Core, ed., *Philip William Otterbein: Pastor, Ecumenist* (Dayton: Board of Publication, the Evangelical United Brethren Church, 1968), 109-27; Paul H. Eller, "Revivalism and the German Churches in Pennsylvania, 1783-1816," Ph.D. diss., University of Chicago, 1933, 153-65; and John B. Frantz, "Revivalism in the German Reformed Church in America to 1850 . . ." (Ph.D. diss., University of Pennsylvania, 1961), 25-68.

[3] See Paul H. Douglas, *The Story of German Methodism: Biography of an Immigrant Soul* (New York: The Methodist Book Concern, 1939), especially 20-33.

[4] Carl Wittke, *William Nast: Patriarch of German Methodism* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1959); see pp. 35-36 where Wittke devotes one paragraph to the early German Methodism of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

5 Note the lack of attention to the early German Methodism of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century in Frank Baker, *From Wesley to Asbury: Studies in Early American Methodism* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1976), 134; Wade Crawford Barclay, *History of Methodist Missions* (New York: Board of Missions and Church Extension of the Methodist Church, 1949-50), 1:273-74; Emory Stevens Buche, ed., *The History of American Methodism* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1964), 95, 592; Frederick Abbott Norwood, *The Story of American Methodism: A History of the United Methodists and their Relations* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1974), 287; William Warren Sweet, *Methodism in American History* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1954), 270-71, 464; and L. C. Rudolph, *Francis Asbury* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1966), 189-91.

[6] For the relationship, see A. W. Nagler, *Pietism and Methodism* (Nashville: Smith and Lamar, 1918); and F. Ernest Stoeffler, ed., *Continental Pietism and Early American Christianity* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1976); F. Ernst Stoeffler's *Rise of Evangelical Pietism* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1965), 13-23, contains a brief definition of Pietism.

[7] Elisabeth Jay, ed., *The Journal of John Wesley: A Selection* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 34-35; and John T. McNeill, *Makers of Christianity from Alfred the Great to Schleiermacher* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, Inc., 1935; Harper Torchbook, 1964), 241-53.

[8] *Journal of John Wesley*, 35-37; and Halford Edward Luccock and Paul Hutchinson, *The Story of Methodism* (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949), 72; for additional information, see F. Ernst Stoeffler, "Religious Roots of the Early Moravian and Methodist Movements," *Methodist History*, n.s., 24 (April 1986): 132-40.

[9] Joe L. Kincheloe, Jr., "European Roots of Evangelical Revivalism: Methodist Transmission of the Pietistic Socio-Religious Tradition," *Methodist History*, n.s., 18 (July 1980): 262-71; and Karl Zehrer, "The Relationship between Pietism in Halle and Early Methodism," trans. James O. Dwyer, *Methodist History*, n.s., 17 (July 1979): 211-24.

[10] Stoeffler, *Evangelical Pietism*, 13-23.

[11] For concise summaries of American Methodists' beliefs, see *The Doctrines and Discipline of the Methodist Episcopal Church* (New York: T. Kirk . . . for the Methodist Society, 1804); their origins in Wesley's thought appears in Norwood, *American Methodism*, 42-60.

[12] Rudolph, *Asbury*, 20.

[13] J. B. Wakely, *The Patriarch of One Hundred Years: Being the Reminiscences, Historical and Biographical of Rev. Henry Boehm* (New York: Nelson and Phillips, 1875; reprint ed., 1982), 111, 173, 310.

[14] *The Journal and Letters of Francis Asbury*, ed. Elmer T. Clark, J. Manning Potts, and Jacob S. Payton (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1958), 2:646; a discussion of the religious situation among the early German colonists in Pennsylvania and neighboring areas appears in John B. Frantz, "The Awakening of Religion Among the German Settlers in the Middle Colonies," *The William and Mary Quarterly*, 3d ser., 33 (April 1976): 267-74.

[15] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:550.

[16] Ibid.

[17] Asbury, *Journal*, 3:274.

[18] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:400.

[19] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:512.

[20] Asbury, *Journal*, 3:274.

[21] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:54, 103; see also William J. Hinke, *Ministers of the German Reformed Congregations in Pennsylvania and Other Colonies in the Eighteenth Century*, ed. George W. Richards (Lancaster: Historical Commission of the Evangelical and Reformed Church, 1951), 171-74.

[22] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:105; for additional information concerning Philip William Otterbein, see O'Malley, *Legacy of the Otterbeins*, 166-84; and Paul H. Eller, "Philip William Otterbein and Francis Asbury," in Core, *Philip William Otterbein*, 62-72.

[23] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:105, 114; "Minutes of the Coetus, 1773," *Minutes and Letters of the Coetus of the German Reformed Congregations in Pennsylvania, 1747-1792* . . . , ed. William J. Hinke (Philadelphia: Reformed Church Publication Board, 1903), 337-38.

[24] "Minutes of the Coetus . . . , 1775," *Minutes and Letters of the Coetus* . . . , 350; the minutes of the United Ministers' meetings appear in Joseph Henry Dubbs, "Otterbein and the Reformed Church," *Reformed Church Quarterly Review* 31 (January 1884): 122-27; see also William J. Hinke, "Philip William Otterbein and the Reformed Church," *The Presbyterian and Reformed Review* 12 (July 1901): 128-42.

[25] For the circumstances of the initial meeting between Otterbein and Martin Boehm, see Drury, *History of the Church of the United Brethren in Christ*, 181-82; note the origins of the society in *Glaubenslehre und Kirchenzucht = Ordnung der Vereinigten Brüder in Christo* (Hagerstadt: Joh. Gruber und D. May, 1822), 6, 8, 10, 12, 14, 16.

[26] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:474, n. 55; 2:753-54; and Rudolph, *Asbury*, 191.

[27] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:406; Asbury used the term "Dutch" to mean German.

[28] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 118; Asbury, *Journal*, 1:194, n. 34; 196, 406; and Klaus Wust, *The Virginia Germans* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1969), 150-51.

[29] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences Annually Held in America, 1773-1813, Inclusive* (New York: Daniel Hitt and Thomas Ward for the Methodist Connexion in the United States, 1813), 492.

[30] Wust, *Virginia Germans*, 150-51; and A. Stapleton, *Annals of the Evangelical Association of North America* . . . (Harrisburg: Publishing House of the United Evangelical Church, 1900), 32.

[31] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 154 (1795).

[32] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 27; and W. P. Strickland, *The Life of Jacob Gruber* (New York: Carlton and Porter, 1860), 12.

[33] Strickland, *Gruber*, 360.

[34] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 112; Strickland, *Gruber*, 18, 24, 30, 123-24, 262-63, 268, 271, 279.

[35] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 12-13, 65-66; see also Kenneth E. Rowe, "Martin Boehm and the Methodists," *Methodist History*, n.s., 8 (July 1969): 49-53.

[36] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 102, 160, 415, 459; and William H. Williams, *The Garden of American Methodism: The Delmarva Peninsula, 1769-1820* (Wilmington: Scholarly Resources, 1984), 84, 140, 159, 161-63, 177.

[37] Asbury, *Journal*, 3:370.

[38] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 19.

[39] Ibid., 113-14.

[40] Ibid., 449; see also 29, 125, 165, 255, 308.

[41] Ibid., 19.

[42] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:401.

[43] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 19, 113.

[44] Ibid., 28, 29, 362, 449; and Asbury, *Journal*, 2:697.

[45] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 29, 341; *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 471 (1810).

[46] *Memoir of the Rev. Jesse Lee with Extracts From His Journals*, ed. Thrift Minton (New York: N. Bangs and T. Mason, 1823), 253-54.

[47] Nathan A. Bangs, *A History of the Methodist Episcopal Church* . . . (New York: T. Mason and G. Lande for the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1838-41), 1:144.

[48] Robert D. Simpson, ed., *The Life and Journals of Freeborn Garrettson* (Rutland, Vermont: Academy Books, 1984), 36, 39-40, 111-12, 183-84; and Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 310.

[49] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:430.

[50] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 166, 310.

[51] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 31 (1781); 35 (1782); and 40 (1783).

[52] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 110.

[53] Ibid., 102.

[54] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:704.

[55] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 102; Asbury, *Journal*, 2:612.

[56] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:53; for the history of religion among the early German settlers in Maryland, see Dieter Cunz, *The Maryland Germans: A History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1948), 60-87.

[57] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 8 (1774); 10 (1775); and 12 (1776).

[58] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:572.

[59] *Minutes and Letters of the Coetus*, 337; for religious conditions in Virginia, see Wust, *Virginia Germans*, 129-51.

[60] Asbury, *Journal*, 1:406.

[61] Ibid., 648.

[62] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 118, 225; and *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 132 (1794); 435 (1809).

[63] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:710.

[64] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 259.

[65] Ibid., 202-63.

[66] Ibid., 204.

[67] Baker, *From Wesley to Asbury*, 40-44; Norwood, *American Methodism*, 67; and Samuel J. Fanning, "Philip Embury, Founder of Methodism in New York," *Methodist History*, n.s., 3 (January 1965): 16-25.

[68] Walter C. Knittle, *Early Eighteenth Century Palatine Emigration* . . . (Philadelphia: Dorrance and Co., 1937), 148-59, 188-205.

[69] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 296; and Garrettson, *Life and Journals*, 263.

[70] Strickland, *Gruber*, 26-27.

[71] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 146 (1794); and 156 (1795).

[72] For the German Lutheran liturgy that was compiled in 1748 by the Rev. Henry Melchior Mühlenberg, the leading German Lutheran pastor in Pennsylvania, see Henry E. Jacobs, *A History of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the United States* (New York: Christian Literature Co., 1893), 270-75; the "Palatinate Liturgy," compiled in 1563, was the standard order of worship among the German Reformed ministers and people; see a modern translation by Bard Thompson in *Theology and Life* 6 (Spring 1963): 49-67.

[73] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 210; for the Methodists' emphasis on preaching, see Norwood, *American Methodism*, 229-30.

[74] Christian Newcomer, *The Life and Journal of the Rev'd Christian Newcomer* . . . , trans. John Hildt (Hagerstown: F. G. W. Kapp, 1834), 111.

[75] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 312-13.

[76] Newcomer, *Journal*, 69.

[77] Ibid., 79; see also 66, 149.

[78] Bangs, *Methodist Episcopal Church*, 1:97.

[79] Strickland, *Gruber*, 24.

[80] Newcomer, *Journal*, 111.

[81] Yeakel, R., *Jacob Albright and His Co-Laborers* (Cleveland: Publishing House of the Evangelical Association, 1883), 56-57, 230; *History of the Classis of Lancaster of the Eastern Synod of the Reformed Church in the United States, 1852-1940*, ed. Daniel G. Glass, C. George Bachman, John F. Frantz, Harry E. Shepardson, J. W. LeVan (New Holland: New Holland Clarion, 1941), 192; and Garrettson, *Life and Journals*, 112.

[82] Philip Schaff, *America: A Sketch of its Political, Social, and Religious Character*, ed. Perry Miller (Cambridge: the Belknap Press of the Harvard University Press, 1961), 142-44; Charles Yrigoyen, Jr. treats "Mercersburg's Quarrel with Methodism" in *Methodist History*, n.s., 22 (October 1983): 3-19.

[83] Strickland, *Gruber*, 28.

[84] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:646.

[85] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 184-85, 242, 256.

[86] Ibid., 174.

[87] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:645, n. 70.

[88] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 175-78; see also *Lehre und Zuchtordnung der Bischöflich = Methodistischen Kirche, Aus dem Englischen übersetzt . . .* (Lancaster: Henrich und Benjamin Grimler, 1808).

[89] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 97 (1791).

[90] Asbury, *Journal*, 3:504-5.

[91] *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 154 (1795).

[92] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 58-59, 374; *Minutes of the Methodist Conferences*, 429; and Williams, *Garden of Methodism*, 84, 110, 140, 159, 161-63, 177.

[93] Strickland, *Gruber*, 123.

[94] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 118.

[95] W. W. Orwig, *History of the Evangelical Association*, vol. 1, *From the Origin of the Association to the end of the year 1845* (Cleveland: Charles Hammer, 1858), 56-57; see also, Asbury, *Journal*, 3:477, n. 50; Norwood, *American Methodism*, 164-74; Wust, *Virginia Germans*, 151; and Douglas, *German Methodism*, 99.

[96] Boehm, *Reminiscences*, 346.

[97] Schaff, *America*, 219.

[98] Norwood, *American Methodism*, 426.

[99] R. Yeakel, *History of the Evangelical Association*, vol. 1, *1750-1850* (Cleveland: Thomas Mattill, 1894), 230; Yeakel, *Albright*, 42; Charles E. Kachel, "Similarities and Differences Between The Methodist Church and The Evangelical United Brethren Church," *Methodist History*, n.s., 3 (October 1964): 12-22; Daryl M. Elliott, "Entire Sanctification and the Church of the United Brethren in Christ to 1860," *Methodist History*, n.s., 24 (July 1987): 203-22.

[100] Paul Blankenship, "Bishop Asbury and the Germans," *Methodist History*, n.s., 4 (April 1966): 5-13.

[101] See *Lehre und Zucht = Ordnung der Vereinigten Brüder*, 6, 8, 10, 12, 14, 16.

[102] Ibid., 22, 24, 26, 28; and Asbury, *Journal*, 3:504; see also Donald K. Gorrell, "'Ride a Circuit or Let It Alone': Early Practises That Kept the United Brethren, Albright People and Methodists Apart," *Methodist History*, n.s., 23 (October 1986): 4-16.

[103] *Lehre und Zucht = Ordnung der Vereinigten Brüder*, 26; 28, 30; see also Jeffrey P. Mickle, "A Comparison of the Doctrines of Ministry of Francis Asbury and Philip William Otterbein," *Methodist History*, n.s., 19 (July 1981): 187-205; see also the early "Minutes of the United Brethren in Christ . . . ," Typescript in translation in the archives of the Central Pennsylvania Conference of the United Methodist Church, Lycoming College Library, Williamsport, Pennsylvania.

[104] Asbury, *Journal*, 2:705, n. 48; and John B. Warman, "Francis Asbury and Jacob Albright," *Methodist History*, n.s., 16 (January 1978): 75-81.

[105] Compare *Die Glaubenslehre und Kirchen = Zucht = Ordnung der Evangelischen Gemeinschaft . . .* (New Berlin: S. G. Miller, 1842) with *Minutes of the Several Conversations Between the Rev. Thomas Coke LL.D., the Rev. Francis Asbury And Others . . . Composing A Form of Discipline for the Ministers, Preachers and Other Members Of The Methodist Episcopal Church in America* (Philadelphia: Charles Cist, 1785).

[106] Yeakel, *Evangelical Association*, 42-43; and Albright, *Evangelical Church*, 71.

[107] Yeakel, *Evangelical Association*, 84; J. Manning Potts discusses Methodist "Attempts at Union 150 Years Ago," in *Methodist History*, n.s., 1 (July 1963): 31-36; see also Rudolph, *Asbury*, 190-91.